

## Refti Handini Listyani<sup>1</sup>\*, Anggaunita Kiranantika<sup>2</sup>, Diah Ariani Arimbi<sup>3</sup>, Emy Susanti<sup>4</sup>

<sup>1</sup>Universitas Negeri Surabaya, Surabaya, Indonesia <sup>2</sup>Ewha Woman's University, Seoul, Korea <sup>3,4</sup>Universitas Airlangga, Surabaya, Indonesia

## Abstract

This study analyzed beauty myths on Instagram accounts of three aesthetic clinics in Indonesia using Sara Mills' critical discourse analysis.Results showed that First, the women were characterized as an object and became the victims, and beauty standards were reconstructed and reproduced by the subjects, namely the Instagram accounts of @dermaster\_id, @ertosbeautyclinic, and @natashaskincare aesthetic clinics. Women objectification could not be separated from the existing beauty myth. Second, there were two categories of beauty representations formed in the three Instagram accounts, namely men's beauty representation that consisted of smooth faces, young looks, and firm jaws, and women's beauty representations that consisted of thin cheeks, firm jaw, firm skin, smooth, acne-free, attractive skin, glass skin, and slim, and halal beauty. The study is expected to enrich the repertoire of social science, especially sociology, and develop research on the sociology of the body, feminism study, and the sociology of gender and media.

*Keywords*: aesthetic clinic, beauty myth, beauty representation, cyberfeminism, critical discourse.

Paper type: Research paper

\*Corresponding author: reftihandini@unesa.ac.id

Received: 26 June 2023; Received in revised form: 29 October 2023; Accepted: 29 October 2023; Available online: 29 October 2023

**Cite this document**: Listyani, Refti Handini. (2023). Aesthetic Clinic and Beauty Myths in Indonesia: Discourse Analysis of Beauty Representation in Instagram Accounts of @Dermaster\_Id, @Ertosbeautyclinic, and @Natashaskincare. *The Journal of Society and Media*, 7(2), 514-545. DOI: 10.26740/jsm.v7n2.p514-545.



#### **INTRODUCTION**

Beauty as a feminine representation has been deeply rooted in a culturally wider programmed social system. Every day, women are convinced by beauty myths that increasingly plunge women into the abyss of worshiping beauty (Andreoni and Petrie 2008; Muassomah et al. 2021; O'Connor and Gladstone 2018; Swami et al. 2013). Beauty or sexuality of women's bodies is always considered as a provocation of sexual harassment against women themselves.

Wolf (2002) talks about the myth of beauty under a cultural approach. Beauty myths are closely related to culture. Women have always been positioned as beings who are seen and judged by men. Stereotypes about women are created to get closer to the beauty myth, so women only have two choices: having a mind or a beauty (Walby 2009; Wolf 2002). Beauty myths have even begun to be instilled in women since childhood; for example, the kid stories are full of masculinity or machoism.

Beauty myths are also inserted through religiosity. The social order uses religiosity to control women's bodies and does not support women's involvement in the secular public world. In addition, religious language is often used in books on diet and women. Patriarchal religion has succeeded in controlling women's sexuality with various myths, such as confirming the importance of virginity for women, hiding or eliminating sources of women's sexual pleasure, such as women's circumcision, so that women cannot enjoy sex perfectly (Walby 1987, 1991). Women's sexuality is defined and constructed into something negative. Morality is often measured by women's bodies and sexuality (Walby 1997; Wolf 2002).

In Indonesia, many aesthetic clinics have sprung up, not only in big cities but also in various cities, including various regions in East Java. Aesthetic clinics offer a variety of product advantages and their respective treatment technology. Unlike the case before when the digital world was not as developed as today, the beauty industry still relies on television and magazines to advertise its beauty products. Along with the development of social media, aesthetic clinics in Indonesia utilize various platforms, including Instagram.

Aesthetic clinics take advantage of social changes where women are now masters and even close to technology. One form of technology used daily by modern women is Instagram. Various Instagram accounts have diverse and interesting content, such as information on recipes, celebrities, plants, hijab, fashion, sports, home, and beauty. These contents make Instagram one of the favorite platforms among women.

Many aesthetic clinics introduce and promote the benefits of their treatments to Instagram women users. Based on the results of initial observations, researchers found many Instagram accounts belonging to well-known aesthetic clinics in various cities in Indonesia. These accounts are described as follows.

Researchers have made initial observations to find out the accounts of aesthetic clinics on Instagram by using several keywords. The first keyword that the researcher used was the word *aesthetic*. The top three accounts that appeared included @*sisterstudio.id* with 34.6 thousand followers, @*msglowclinicsby* with 79.7 thousand followers, and @*griyaayuclinic* with 17.3 thousand followers.



## Figure 1.

#### An Aesthetic Clinic Account with The Keyword Aesthetic: @Sisterstudio.Id

Source: Photo courtesy of @sisterstudio.id

Next, the researchers tried to find an aesthetic clinic account on Instagram with the keyword *derma*, which means skin. When discussing beauty, it cannot be separated from skincare. The first account that appeared at the top when the researcher entered the keyword *derm* was @*dermaster\_id* (see Figure 2).

## Figure 2.

An Aesthetic Clinic Account with the Keyword Derm: @Dermaster\_Id



Source: Photo Courtesy Of @Dermaster\_Id.

Afterward, the researchers used the word skin to obtain more existing aesthetic clinics. Several accounts appeared with a blue tick. Among others, only the @natasahaskincare account was an aesthetic clinic. Meanwhile, @skincare by L'oreal, @babypinkskincare, and @sanaturelofficial were accounts of beauty products in the form of skincare, such as beauty creams and makeup.

## Figure 3.

An Aesthetic Clinic Account with the Keyword Skin: @Natashaskincare



Source: Photo Courtesy Of @Natashaskincare

Throughout history, the myth that connects beauty with women is timeless and persists against all attempts on the contrary. Consequently, society forces people to accept half of the beauty myths about women's bodies. Moreover, being beautiful and charming actually comes from the patriarchal capitalist society (Walby 1991, 2011). In the patriarchal reality, beauty is a term associated with women, and being beautiful is the totality of a woman's existence.

Wolf (2002) reveals that beauty is one of the social controls against women. Various myths about beauty were created by the patriarchal powers to strengthen their dominance over women. The definition of beauty is political because its essence is a representation of power relations. Wolf's critique of beauty myth implies that beauty is not in reality and is not objective in society (Lohyn 1994; Wolf 2002). The present study aimed to identify and analyze the beauty myths depicted in the Instagram accounts of three big aesthetic clinics in Indonesia.

To the best of the researchers' knowledge, research on women and beauty has not been conducted a lot. Listyani, et.al., (2018) conducted a study about the beauty myth of Muslim women when wearing hijab. Through the perspective of cyber-feminism, The study explained that the presentation of Muslim women on Instagram contributed to constructing discourse about the beautiful concept of Muslim women (Pabbajah et al. 2021). Contemporary Muslim women were more aware of creating their identity without looking at the social interpretation attached to them. On the Instagram account, the woman had been both a producer and a consumer of her own beauty (Listyani, Utami, and Sadewo 2018).

Furthermore, the research on the Representation of Women's Beauty in Instagram Social Media (Roland Barthes' Semiotic Analysis on the @Mostbeautyindo, @Bidadarisurga, and @Papuan\_girl Accounts) conducted by Aprilita and Listyani (2016) used the perspective of Roland Barthes' semiotic analysis. In connection with the study results, the three accounts represented different types of beauty. The beauty myths depicted by the @mostbeautyindo account were modern and sensual beauty. @biddarisurga\_ account showed the myth of Islamic beauty. At last, the @papuan\_girl account created a beauty myth in the form of local beauty (Aprilita and Listyani 2016).

In the critical paradigm, every language that appeared was not in the form of text or conversation and was not seen as something natural and neutral but as a form of power struggle. Every discourse analysis is always associated with the power dimension. In contrast to Marx, who looks at power as belonging to the bourgeois or ruling class (Marx and Engels 1971), Foucault views power as not belonging to the ruling class. Power is a strategic area, a place where the relationship between the strong and weak things occurs (Foucault 2004). This is in accordance with the expression between text producers and text consumers. Power is not always regarded as a negative means that resists something that suppresses and negates; on the contrary, it is regarded as something that is productive (Banerjee 1995).

Practically, the research on the representation of beauty that is not displayed by the Aesthetic Clinic Instagram account provides input that the beauty myth is an attempt of the patriarchal society to control women through their beauty (Bettman 2005; Swami et al. 2013). The concept of beauty in today's times teaches two things mainly to women, namely, the adoration of the fear of increasing age and the worship of body weight control.

Texts that lead to the beauty standards in society have caused suffering for some women who are not considered to be below the beauty average. When a woman cannot meet the beauty standards applied in society, it is most likely that they are suffering from the feeling of being uncomfortable, lonely, isolated, and low self-pride (Wolf 2002). In coping with this study, the texts can be profiles, photos, captions, and videos depicted on Instagram accounts.

#### **Development of Aesthetic Clinic on Instagram**

Beauty myths intimidate women in such a systematic and organized way. As long as women think that being beautiful is not in accordance with the representation of society's perspective, there is only one absolute need; the myth of beauty will not always be shackled (Lohyn 1994; Wolf 2002). The standard measure of beauty is a cultural construct. Men, as the second stakeholder, have created boundaries and measurements in the concept of beauty. Women, as the party who becomes the object, will try to achieve these standards in order to have the predicate of beautiful women. The justification of the prevailing concept has created a new myth called the beauty myth (Wolf 2002; Wulan 2017).

Rogers, in Barbie Culture: A Cultural Icon of Consumerism, said that the Barbie doll was a beauty myth. The doll showed strong femininity, and its body construction as a young girl was perfect: beautiful hair, long legs, perfect breasts, and a slim waist. In fact, the concept of beauty is always changing and does not have limitations (Rogers 1996). There are several aspects that become the path for the beauty myth in changing the interpretation of women's character. These aspects include patriarchal culture, the beauty industry, and the medical world (Anugrah 2015).

In the history of humanity, the size and shape of a woman's body are often not identified with beauty. The mass media, especially in the 1960s, mostly appeared to be a slim figure. Besides being used as a symbol of beauty, a slim body was also not considered a symbol of women's rebellion. The trend of slim bodies had become a breakthrough that women were not just mere reproductive flies (Frith 2014).

Then, during the 1990s, women did not beautify their physiques due to the absence of various new inventions in the field of cosmetic technology that began to appear and gave fresh air to those who felt their bodies were less perfect. As long as issues related to beauty or physical beauty are still alive in the midst of society, the worship of an ideal body shape is increasingly demanded. Even though that is not the case, a woman is actually denying her right not to be seen and not admired for what she is (Adamović and Maskalan 2011; Hurd Clarke et al. 2007; Weeks and Thomas 2014).

There are several elements that interact and influence each other at the same time in the beauty industry, including the pharmaceutical industry, the beauty industry, the advertising industry, and the medical industry. Aesthetic clinics are part of the beauty industry, which is a health service facility for individual or group physician practices. It is outpatient in nature by providing medical services such as consultation, examination, treatment, and medical action. The difference between aesthetic clinics and ordinary beauty salons is that they sell various types of beauty products, which are usually made by doctors or experts themselves and are not products with well-known brands. It can be said that aesthetic clinics produce beauty products with their own brand.

The presence of beauty products, as well as the aesthetics clinic, shows that the objectification of beauty has emerged. Consequently, this is able to change the construction of beauty in society from the unwanted to the wanted ones, from chubby to thin or V-shape, and dull skin to glowing beauty. With such development, it has been a patron for women who want to redefine their body function and position. Meaning that women have actively and consciously positioned themselves as consumers of this industry. Traditional values that emphasize women maintain their body look are not presented and mediated through the existing new industry (Listyani and Susanti 2020; Oumeish 2001).

The concept of beauty that underlies the beauty of the industrial complex is the concept of beauty that is full of tension, interest, and personal motives. Women can use the beauty industry as a facility or a vehicle to achieve their idealism. Women clearly have the choice to make themselves either as an object or as a subject (Prabasmoro 2006, 2013). Differences in social strata, definitions, traditions, and means used to achieve beauty (Gimlin 2000; Holliday 2006; Seawright 2014).

#### Women and Technology in Cyberfeminism

According to Haraway, women can reject men's hegemony by identifying themselves with technological sophistication. Cyberculture machines can contribute independence to women. Haraway replaced the traditional dualism associated with men's and women's traits with culture and technology. Women are no longer a representation of "an existence", someone who is not marginalized, someone who is different, just being an object, but present in the middle of the human army and the machine (Gillis 2007; Haraway 2006)

In her study about the Cyborg Manifesto, Haraway (2006) identified a new feminism that involved the image of a 'cyborg'–a cybernetic organism, a graft between machine and organism (Haraway 2006). The blurring of boundaries between humans and machines makes the categories of men and women not used. Moreover, an open wide path to a world with freedom outside gender is the new, possibly applied conception (Gillis 2007; Hall 1996). Furthermore, Haraway states that people live in a world of cyborg electronic communication where the difference between artificial and natural ones remains ambiguous (Gamble 2010).

The concept of cyborgs in the context of cyberfeminism has helped overcome all dichotomies, including women or men, and promises a genderless utopia. Manifestations of cyberfeminism and cyborg narratives are seen in digital worlds–computer-mediated environments – such as the internet. Cyberfeminism has shown that internet technology

can't function as the great equalizer and cannot be used for the empowerment of marginalized groups throughout the world (Kusuma and Vitasari n.d.; Mulyaningrum 2015). In this context, the internet can't be described as a technology that offers power at a relatively low cost and can equalize the differences that people impose on others due to their gender or economic status (Power 2005).

Cyberfeminism offers a utopia of liberation, liberation from domination and subordination, as well as liberation from technology that is controlled by men (Numes 1995; Wellman and Gulia 1999). This vision of liberation begins with the image of cyborgs noted where there is a blurring boundary between humans and machines (Cindy Royal 2008; Reed 2014; Royal 2005).

#### **METHODS**

The study used a qualitative research approach with Sara Mills' critical discourse analysis. Mills (a theorist of language and sexism) focused on the discourse on feminism depicted in the media, showing how media bias worked in presenting women. Thus, something shown by Mills was known as a feminist perspective. Mills believed that text and images indirectly communicated with audiences (Mills 2008). Therefore, Mills focused on gender and subject-object position (Mills 2011). In general, there were two things to consider in the analysis: first, how the actors in the text were positioned in the news, which the positioned party in the text was, and what the consequences were. Second, it was about how the subjects were positioned in the text. The text was interpreted here as the result of negotiations between the subject and the object (Mills 2016).

A qualitative research approach with a critical discourse analysis was chosen because the data were based on the researcher's interpretation of a text. In addition, the critical paradigm was used to reveal an ideology or the implied meanings of a discourse. Discourse analysis with Sara Mills' perspective emphasized how women were imaged in a text. The focus of the critical discourse of Sara Mills' model was on the position of the subject-object as well as the position of the reader in the story (Agnes Bodis 2014; Lillian 2016; Mills 2016).

The focus of this study was the critical discourse analysis on beauty that was not represented in the three Instagram accounts, namely @dermaster\_id, @ertosbeautyclinic, and @natashaskincare. The data were collected using observation and documentation on the Instagram accounts of the three aesthetic

clinics, supported by the literature studies. The determination of the analytical unit was based on an aesthetic clinic that had an Instagram account with the highest number of followers in Indonesia, namely, @dermaster\_id with 655 thousand followers, @ertosbeautyclinic with 515 thousand followers, @natashaskincare with 399 thousand followers. This shows that the aesthetic clinic already had an undoubted brand image. The next criterion was that the displayed content posts were the various beauty products they offered, including treatments with the latest medical technology. Furthermore, the selected Instagram account was an aesthetic clinic account that actively posted its superior products.

## Figure 4.

Profiles Of Each Aesthetic Clinic Account That Became The Present Study's Research Object



Source: Photo Courtesy Of @Dermaster\_Id, @Ertosbeautyclinic, @Natashaskincare

Sara Mils is concerned with the actors' positions in the text. The position was in the sense that the subject of the story would not determine the structure of the text and how the meaning was treated in the text as a whole. Sara Mills also focused on how readers and the author (in coping with the present study context, the readers were Instagram woman users, and the author was an aesthetic clinic account) were portrayed in the text.



# Research Flow of Beauty Representation in Aesthetic Clinics' Instagram Accounts with Sara Mills' Discourse Analysis



#### **RESULTS AND DISCUSSION**

Beauty clinics' Instagram accounts were made based on segmentation, ideological, and capitalist considerations. This showed that the beauty clinics' Instagram accounts, as one of the visual culture products, play an active role in building beauty myths. In the representation of beauty displayed in the beauty clinics' Instagram accounts, there was a double practice that showed beauty in two domains, namely, the presentation of beauty as capital and the presentation of beauty as an object of consumption. This assumption would eventually form new beauty myths in life.



## **Aesthetic Clinic's Instagram Account Profiles**

## Figure 6.

## **Tagline and Biography of Each Aesthetic Clinic**



Source: Photo Courtesy Of @Dermaster\_Id, @Ertosbeautyclinic, @Natashaskincare

## Figure 7.

## Various Beauty Products and Treatments Offered By the Beauty Clinics



Source: Photo Courtesy Of @Dermaster\_Id, @Ertosbeautyclinic, @Natashaskincare



Source: Photo Courtesy Of @Dermaster\_Id, @Ertosbeautyclinic, @Natashaskincare

## Texts describing Beauty Myths on @dermaster\_id

Myth of men beauty on @dermaster\_id

Figure 9.

## Men and Masculine Beauty Standards



Source: Photo Courtesy Of @Dermaster\_Id

Through the texts, Handsome Shines, ten years younger without surgery and handsome, Dermaster created symbols of beauty for men. Dermaster also associated an attractive appearance as a symbol of happiness and health. Men also could not be separated from masculine beauty standards. It could be said that Dermaster's account created a representation of beauty not only for women but also for men.

## Figure 10.



Source: Photo Courtesy Of @Dermaster\_Id

## Women beauty myths on @dermaster\_id

# Figure 11. Firm Face Doesn't Age USINYA ? KOMBINASI TOS EV & THREAD 2G EXCELLENCE VISAGE an kolagen an efek lifti THREAD 2G QV 1 T APTOS S REST TICHTENING T SELAMAT HARI KARTINI ♡ () ♥ 1.124 likes 0

Source: Photo Courtesy Of @Dermaster\_Id

In the first picture, there is a text *even a landslide can happen*. This sentence seems to show that a sagging face was a disaster, especially for women, like a landslide. The second picture shows an explanation of Dermaster's flagship product, which was a thread used to pull and tighten facial skin as a solution for sagging skin due to aging. The third picture shows a post with the text *Happy Kartini's Day*, which consists of two types of women's aging phases. The first phase showed normal women aging consisting of toddlers, young children, adolescents, adults (starting to show signs of aging), and the elderly (with all the signs of aging experienced). The second phase showed the phase of a woman's growth consisting of toddlers, young children, teenagers, adults, and adults without aging. This representation of women's beauty conveyed by Dermaster was the fact that beautiful women were those who always looked young by doing treatments at Dermaster.

# Figure 12. The Results of Pulling APTOS Treatment for Tight Skin and Youthful Effects



Source: Photo courtesy of @dermaster\_id

The captions referred to a form of persuasion. If they were addressed to women, most of them wanted to have an ideal slim body. The narration could also be interpreted as a sign that, after pulling APTOS treatment, women got a slim face and looked younger, ideal, and healthy, which had been every woman's dream. This APTOS treatment was indeed the flagship product of the Dermaster's clinic.

The texts *Perfect Young Youth* and *Perfect Toned Cheeks* referred to one of the beauty standards. Dermaster is a beauty clinic that has a superior thread lift treatment with APTOS thread for tightening skin and emphasizing the shape of the jaw and chin, promising toned facial skin and a look ten years younger.

## Figure 13.

## **Glowing Without Makeup**



Source: Photo Courtesy Of @Dermaster\_Id

Women's beauty was synonymous with make-up. Women who did not meet the ideal beauty standards set by the beauty industry and media often used makeup as the solution. However, along with the development of medical aesthetic technology, beauty clinics offered various beauty procedures, which promised that beauty could be obtained without depending on makeup. In line with that, Dermaster created several tag lines such as *maximum glowing, glowing no makeup, glowing like glass, glowing without filter, perfect no makeup*, and *shiny hits*.





Source: Photo courtesy of @dermaster\_id

Figure 14 shows the figure of a dangdut artist named Iis Dahlia, who stated that "according to research, people who have an attractive appearance have a greater chance of success in their careers". The statement implied that beauty myths were being reproduced. Viewers or followers of the Dermaster account also gave comments in agreement, such as "*Me*, yes", "*I really agree*", and "*Absolutely* 

*yes*!". The number of likes also reached 1,372, which indicated that they also agreed with the opinion that beauty determined career success, especially for women. This revealed that the beauty standard reproduced by the beauty clinic was accepted by the public.

## Figure 15. Issues of Career Women



## Source: Photo Courtesy Of @Dermaster\_Id

In their Instagram account, Dermaster not only offers beauty products but sometimes also inserts symbols of active, modern, and career women. In this case, Dermaster's account tried to create an image that Dermaster really supported women, not only in matters of body and beauty but also in terms of being a career woman. In short, if women want to have a successful career, it must be supported by a beautiful appearance. Moreover, being beautiful, Dermaster was the answer. From a feminist perspective, it was very unfortunate that the viewers and followers of the Dermaster account agreed with the opinion above by giving likes, symbols of hearts, and agreeing comments.

It was not in line with Haraway's intentions and expectations that women who were technologically literate in the midst of the digital world should be able to perceive an open mindset (Haraway 2006). However, technological developments did not then make women free from the existing beauty myths. Women were actually getting closer and more dependent on the ever-evolving beauty technology.

#### Texts describing Beauty Myths on @ertosbeautyclinic

Myth of men's beauty on @ertosbeautyclinic. A younger-looking appearance was not only needed by women. Ertos Beauty Clinic offered treatments that promised to look ten years younger. This showed that looking young was a representation of masculine beauty.

## Figure 16.

## **Facial Care for Men**



Source: Photo Courtesy Of @Ertosbeautyclinic

## Women beauty myths on @dermaster\_id

## Figure 17.

## Glass Skin and Baby Skin



Source: Photo Courtesy of @Ertosbeautyclinic

# Figure 18.

## Muslim Women's Beauty Myths



Source: Photo Courtesy Of @Ertosbeautyclinic



Source: Photo courtesy of @ertosbeautyclinic

Figure 19 depicts that the representation of beauty conveyed by Ertos Beauty Aesthetic Clinic wanted to show that beauty must have a glass skin. Beauty was also represented by healthy skin, like soft baby skin. Furthermore, beauty was represented by smooth, hairless skin, a thin face shape or v-shape, a younger face look, firm without wrinkles, no double chin, and a slim body without a fat belly.

Ertos Beauty Clinic's Instagram account also had a uniqueness that did not appear on the Dermaster Clinic account and Natasha Skincare Clinic account in representing beauty. Ertos Beauty also had a target market for Muslim women and paid attention to the beauty needs of Muslim women, apart from the appearance on their Instagram bio-account. This can be seen by displaying uploads of doctors and hijab models in their product posts. This showed the representation of halal beauty in accordance with Islamic law.

#### Texts Describing Beauty Myths on @natashaskincare

Similar to the two aesthetic clinic accounts, Natasha Skincare Clinic also had various beauty and treatment products, including facial skin care, eyes, and hair, to sharpen the nose.

Myth of men's beauty on @natashaskincare. Natasha Skincare Aesthetic Clinic had the characteristic of offering beauty products by categorizing them based on the day of visit. There were several terms, such as "beautiful Tuesday", "handsome Wednesday", "Charming Thursday," and "Blessing Friday". Each text showed a different treatment classification between men, women, and Muslim women.

## Figure 20.

## **Different treatment packages**



Source: Photo courtesy of @natashaskincare

Natasha Skincare's aesthetic clinic provides and offers beauty products for men. Figure 21 portrays the representation of men's beauty as shown by showing a mulatto man model with white skin as a representation of handsome men.

## Figure 21.

## Handsome Wednesday



Source: Photo courtesy of @natashaskincare

## Women's beauty myths on @natashaskincare

Figure 22.

## Acne-Free Skin Beauty Myths



Source: Photo courtesy of @natashaskincare

The new femininity feature shown in the image above was short hair. Short hair showed the impression of a modern woman. The beauty representation shown in Figure 22 is a beautiful modern woman with acne-free facial skin.



Source: Photo courtesy of @natashaskincare

Figure 23 shows that beauty was associated with knowledge. Figure 23 depicts how to use proper skincare as a form of women understanding and paying attention to the condition of their skin and body.

## Figure 24.

## **Beauty Myths Of Healthy And Dandruff-Free Long Hair**





In the past, beauty referred to a woman who had white skin and straight blonde hair. However, Natasha Skincare displayed a picture of a beautiful woman with curly black hair and a typical Indonesian skin color.

## Figure 25. Beautiful Tuesday



Source: Photo Courtesy of @Natashaskincare

The physical characteristics of the model shown in Figure 25 represented a new image of women's beauty. The model had unique physical characteristics, including black and curly hair and brownish skin. The shift in the representation of beauty for women was contained in the model figure. In the past, white skin was always identical to beauty and high social class. However, Natasha Skincare showed that brown skin was now a skin that represented exotic beauty and high social status. The shift in beauty myths and the representation of beautiful women posted by Natasha Skincare clinic accounts created a new paradigm for the representation of brown skin, but still with the interests of the beauty industry that brown skin must still be clean, smooth, glowing, and firm as a beautiful measure for women to sell their products.

# Figure 26. Muslim Women's Beauty Myths



Source: Photo Courtesy Of @Natashaskincare

The "Blessing Friday" post was juxtaposed with a women model who wore a hijab. The word "blessing Friday" itself was synonymous with the term in Islam, namely glorifying Friday more than any other day. This showed that Natasha Skincare's Instagram account was trying to give the impression that this clinic had special programs offered to Muslim women on special days. So, the representation who wore a hijab was a beautiful Muslim woman with halal treatments and products at Natasha Skincare.

# Figure 27. Beauty Myths of Being Younger



Source: Photo Courtesy of @Natashaskincare

Figure 27 shows that Sophia Latjuba represented women who were over 40 years old. Natasha Skincare represented that beauty was to look younger. Through the method of sharing tips, Natasha Skincare represented that beauty was not aging. For this reason, anti-aging products were needed, as offered by Natasha Skincare.



Source: Photo courtesy of @natashaskincare

The side of the face was highlighted to show that the beauty was thin with a firm jaw and a sharp nose. From the clothes worn by the model, a showing-off shoulder look showed a smooth back without any skin damage. Figure 28 conveys that beauty did not require thick makeup, but it was enough to undergo treatment at Natasha Skincare Clinic.

#### Beauty representations depicted on the aesthetic clinics' Instagram accounts

Beauty myths in today's global era operate in the world of visual technology. When beauty was allowed to become a pile of myths, the opportunities for colonization of Indonesia were more wide open. The beauty of women in Instagram accounts was presented based on a broad frame of stereotypes against women, namely in the form of reproductive characteristics of femininity or re-encoded. Stereotypes reproduced by beauty clinics through posting pictures and texts of ideal beauty symbols were representations of women's beauty. However, this stereotypical frame also applies to men.

Currently, there is a new definition of an attractive man, namely beautiful with masculinity. This was inseparable from the tendency of Generation Z to be more fluid in viewing the concept of gender. Generation Z was known as a group that did not care about gender construction in the past. They tended to be known for not seeing sexuality or gender as having two types. For them, all human beings were free to express themselves. Treatments and cosmetics for men represented ways in which men broke gender norms. Men's cosmetics also put additional pressure on men to look perfect by having flawless skin, strong eyebrows, and sharp cheekbones.





This change was a good signal that the beauty industry was getting better. Statistics predicted that, in 2023, the value of this industry's profits will penetrate \$27.76 billion. The development of the beauty industry with the market not only

Source: Tirto (Id 2017).

for women but also for men showed the convergence of masculinity and femininity. This had something to do with their acceptance of women figures and the concept of gender equality that was more advanced than the previous generation.

In a world where men were usually spoiled with patriarchal ideology, not all men could be free to use cosmetic products. In fact, the closeness of men with beauty tools had existed for a long time. The history could be traced back to the time of the Pharaohs when Egyptian men would only be confident when wearing eyeliner. In addition to supporting their appearance, eyeliner was used to support their worship process. Then, in the 14<sup>th</sup> century, men of the royal family in Europe often sprinkled powder on their faces to distinguish themselves from ordinary people.

Society's definition of masculinity became more rigid. The use of makeup by men began to decline. In the 20<sup>th</sup> century, it was considered quite a taboo subject. Increasingly, only certain jobs with the involvement of cameras allowed men to use cosmetics, such as rock singers, politicians, or actors.

In the 1970s, gothic and punk music spread as a form of protest against power. The children's band, whose members were generally boys, began to wear cosmetic products on their faces when performing on stage. Robert Smith of The Cure was one such example. The figures of Marc Bolan and David Bowie became two musicians who became pioneers of glam rock, a sub-genre of rock music from the United Kingdom whose musicians wore makeup and hair styled in such a way and wore high-heeled boots. They often put glitter or metallic cosmetic products on their faces. In the younger generation, there were Johnny Depp, Jared Leto, and Brandon Flowers, who did similar things. Not all were homosexuals like Freddie Mercury or Boy George. Most of the men were heterosexual and rejected labeling in society. They showed that makeup had nothing to do with sexual orientation.

Women had body parts used as objects of beauty and had social meaning for society. Anthony Synnott summed up some of these body parts, one of which was the face, a unique, soft, and public human physical part (Synnott 1993, 2002). Face was also a basic determinant of perception about the meaning of individual beauty and ugliness. The skin was also the part exposed to the media, especially advertisements. Overall, the human body became the object of advertising. Women seemed to have no power over their bodies, especially their faces. Women were directed to see beautiful standards according to the interests of capitalists, namely the beauty industry, through Instagram accounts. In the beauty clinic's Instagram account, the body was a commodify media. Instagram accounts as a dual commodification media that facilitated various commodification practices were managed and became public consumption.

The ideology of patriarchy was still framed through beauty myths that were deliberately created as hallucinations of the ideal woman to make other women feel angry about her appearance. The beauty myth was deliberately created by the capitalists to standardize the ideal beauty to perpetuate its power. This beauty myth discourse was a potential tactical element in the arena of power relations. Here, power also encourages sexuality in decent and divergent jobs encountered by neoliberalism capitalism and how it comes from feminism, though. Recently, beauty myths and beauty technology have been used as modern cultural representations.

The use of model to represent the iron maiden figure (a term used by Naomi Wolf) was described as a woman who had natural beauty on her Instagram account feed using a well-known artist (Wolf 2002). By maximizing beauty treatment and using beauty technology, women are still captured as a category of agency rather than their bodies that are socially constructed nowadays. The word natural did not mean that it could be separated from the use of cosmetics and beauty product technology, but it was highly recommended to be able to have perfect beauty.

The use of models was not only limited to women but also men. Not only were women very concerned about their appearance and beauty, but men were also required to do so. Posts on Instagram feeds provide inspiration and ideal body images for both men and women. So, the beauty clinic's Instagram account feed did not only standardize the body image and beauty of women but also for men. Metrosexual men were also a discourse that was also spread by the beauty clinic's Instagram account.

#### Figure 30.



# The Framework for The Representation of Beauty on The Beauty Clinic's Instagram Account in The Perspective of Sara Mills.

The beauty representation displayed on the beauty clinic's Instagram account was still a reproduction of the definition of ideal beauty that was previously constructed by the West. The representation of white women deliberately shaped by the media was still very strong. This was evidenced by the beauty construction formed by Instagram, which made many women think that beauty was as shown in the mass media. The demands made by social media that required women to have white, slim, and toned skin were very stressful.

#### CONCLUSION

This study has identified and analyzed the beauty myths depicted in the Instagram accounts of three big aesthetic clinics in Indonesia. The present study found that First, the existence of women is shown as an object where they become the victims of symbols and beauty standards reconstructed and reproduced by the beauty clinics, namely @dermaster\_id, @ertosbeautyclinic, and @natashaskincare. Women as objects could not be separated from the beauty myth. Second, there are two categories of beauty representations formed on @dermaster\_id, @ertosbeautyclinic, and @natashaskincare, namely men's beauty representations consisting of smooth faces, young looks, and firm jaws, and women's beauty representations consisting of thin cheeks, firm jaw, firm skin,

smooth skin, acne-free, attractive skin, glass skin, and slim, and halal beauty. Women's beauty is represented by reproducing the stereotype of feminine characteristics. This character is reproduced through posts in the form of photos, videos, and text in the caption. Beauty is always being redefined, reformulated, and re-dictated, and Instagram accounts as a medium are a powerful tool for socializing and selling new beauty products. Thirty years since the beauty myth by Naomi Wolf, the world has been providing a physical assessment of beauty as perpetuated by beauty clinic accounts. The beauty myth expressed by Naomi Wolf is still lasting and relevant today.

#### **Funding Acknowledgement**

The study was supported by funding from the Non-Tax State Revenue Fund 2021 of Universitas Negeri Surabaya.

## **About the Author**

Refti Handini Listyani has published "Love, Class Struggle, and Violence: Framing Analysis on the Ideology behind Film Television (FTv) in Indonesia" in the Journal of Society, 2022. Her first book is "The Dynamics of Sexual Behaviour in Open Society", 2017, among other books. She obtained her Doctoral degree in Sociology from Universitas Airlangga, Indonesia, in 2023. She is an Assistant Professor of Sociology of Body and Gender Studies Faculty of Social Sciences and Law State University of Surabaya, Indonesia.

Diah Ariani Arimbi is a lecturer at Department of English Literature, Universitas Airlangga, Surabaya, Indonesia. She is a Professor of Cultural Studies and Gender at, the Faculty of Cultural Studies, Universitas Airlangga, Indonesia.

Anggaunita Kiranantika is a PhD. Candidate in the Department of Women Studies, Ewha Woman's University Seoul Korea. She is majoring in gender and work and recently took research on gender politics among Indonesian women workers in South Korea. Currently, she is also a lecturer in the Sociology Department at Universitas Negeri Malang, Indonesia.

Emy Susanti is a lecturer at Department of Sociology, Universitas Airlangga, Surabaya, Indonesia. She is a Professor of Sociology at the Gender Faculty of Social and Political Sciences, Universitas Airlangga, Indonesia.

#### REFERENCES

- Adamović, Mirjana, and Ana Maskalan. 2011. "Body, Identity and Body Modifications." *Sociologija i Prostor* 49(1):49–70. doi: 10.5673/sip.49.1.3.
- Agnes Bodis. 2014. "Sara Mills, Gender Matters: Feminist Linguistic Analysis." *Discourse and Society*. Doi: https://doi.org/10.1177/0957926513490319.
- Andreoni, James, and Ragan Petrie. 2008. "Beauty, Gender and Stereotypes: Evidence from Laboratory Experiments." *Journal of Economic Psychology* 29(1):73–93. doi: 10.1016/j.joep.2007.07.008.
- Anugrah, Asep. 2015. "Mitos Kecantikan Dalam Cerpen Barbitch Dan Lipstik Merah Tua Karya Sagita Suryoputri (Telaah Kritik Sastra Feminisme)." Jurnal Humanika 3(15).
- Aprilita, Dini, and Refti H. Listyani. 2016. "Representasi Kecantikan Perempuan Dalam Media Sosial Instagram (Analisis Semiotika Roland Barthes Pada Akun @Mostbeautyindo, @Bidadarisurga, Dan @Papuan\_girl)." Paradigma 4(3).
- Banerjee, Sarmistha. 1995. "Alienation, Power, and Gender in Sociological Theory: A Study of Marx, Foucault, and Feminism." Northern Illinois University.
- Bettman, Catherine Gilda. 2005. "Patriarchy: The Predominant Discourse and Font of Domestic Violence." (July).
- Cindy Royal. 2008. "Framing the Internet: A Comparison of Gendered Spaces." *Sage Journal* 26(2):152–69. doi: https://doi.org/10.1177%2F0894439307307366.
- Foucault, Michel. 2004. The Archeology of Knowledge. London: Routledge.
- Frith, Katherine. 2014. "Globalizing Beauty: A Cultural History of the Beauty Industry." in *International Communication Association*. Seattle.
- Gamble, Sarah. 2010. Pengantar Memahami Feminisme. Yogyakarta: Jalasutra.
- Gillis, Stacy. 2007. "Neither Cyborg nor Goddess the (Im)Possibilities of Cyberfeminism." in *Third Wave Feminism: A Critical Exploration*.
- Gimlin, Debra. 2000. "Cosmetic Surgery: Beauty as Commodity." *Qualitative* Sociology 23(1):77–98. doi: 10.1023/A:1005455600571.
- Hall, Kira. 1996. *CyberFeminism*. Vol. 39. edited by Susan C. Herring. Amsterdam/Philadelphia: Spinifex Press.

- Haraway, Donna. 2006. "A Cyborg Manifesto: Science, Technology, and Socialist-Feminism in the Late 20th Century." Pp. 117–58 in Weiss J., Nolan J., Hunsinger J., Trifonas P. (eds) The International Handbook of Virtual Learning Environments. Springer, Dordrecht.
- Holliday, R. 2006. "Aesthetic Surgery as False Beauty." *Feminist Theory* 7(2):179–95. doi: 10.1177/1464700106064418.
- Hurd Clarke, Laura, Meridith Griffin, Laura Hurd Clarke, and Meridith Griffin. 2007. "The Body Natural and the Body Unnatural: Beauty Work and Aging." Journal of Aging Studies 21(3):187–201. doi: 10.1016/j.jaging.2006.11.001.
- Id, Tirto. 2017. "Ledakan Industri Kecantikan Pria." Retrieved (https://tirto.id/ledakan-industri-kecantikan-pria-cuZc).
- Kusuma, Rina Sari, and Yuan Vitasari. n.d. "Gendering the Internet : Perempuan Pada Ruang Gender Yang Berbeda." 125–42.
- Lillian, Donna. 2016. "Review of Gender Matters: Feminist Linguistic Analysis, Sara Mills (2012)." *Journal of Language and Politics* 15(4):504–6. doi: 10.1075/jlp.15.4.09lil.
- Listyani, Refti Handini, and Emy Susanti. 2020. "The Concept of Beauty and Body Consciousness of Young Muslim Women at Higher Education in Surabaya, Indonesia." *Talent Development & Excellence* 12(1):2034–46.
- Listyani, Refti Handini, Diyah Utami, and FX. Sri Sadewo. 2018. "Beauty Myth of Muslim Women." 226(Icss):306–10.
- Lohyn, Marta. 1994. "Naomi Wolf and the New Feminism: Women's Power Revisited." A.N.Z. J. Farn. Ther. 15(3):143-49.
- Marx, Karl, and Friedrich Engels. 1971. "The Communist Manifesto."
- Mills, Sara. 2008. "Language and Sexism." 178.
- Mills, Sara. 2011. Gender Matters: Feminist Linguistic Analysis. Equinox Publishing Limited.
- Mills, Sara. 2016. Feminist Stylistics.
- Muassomah, Muassomah, Wildana Wargadinata, Galuh Nur Rohmah, Rohmani Nur Indah, Siti Masitoh, Istiadah Istiadah, and Irwan Abdullah. 2021. "Femininity and Masculinity in Arabic Words: Gender Marking in Muslim

Cosmology." *Langkawi: Journal of The Association for Arabic and English* 7(2):182–96. doi: 10.31332/LKW.V7I2.3130.

- Mulyaningrum. 2015. "Cyberfeminisme: Mengubah Ketidaksetaraan Gender Melalui Teknologi Informasi Dan Komunikasi." Pp. 1–8 in *Seminar Nasional*.
- Numes, Mark. 1995. "Baudrillard in Cyberspace: Internet, Virtuality, and Postmodernity." *Style* 29:314–17.
- O'Connor, Kathleen M., and Eric Gladstone. 2018. "Beauty and Social Capital: Being Attractive Shapes Social Networks." *Social Networks* 52:42–47. doi: 10.1016/j.socnet.2017.05.003.
- Oumeish, Oumeish Youssef. 2001. "The Cultural and Philosophical Concepts of Cosmetics in Beauty and Art through the Medical History of Mankind." *Clinics in Dermatology* 19(4):375–86. doi: 10.1016/S0738-081X(01)00194-8.
- Pabbajah, Mustaqim, Hasse Jubba, Irwan Abdullah, M. Taufiq Hidayat Pabbajah, and Juhansar. 2021. "From the Scriptural to the Virtual: Indonesian Engineering Students Responses to the Digitalization of Islamic Education." *Teaching Theology & Religion* 24(2):122–30. doi: 10.1111/TETH.12581.
- Power, Margaret. 2005. "Gender, Modernity, and Technology: Chile under Four Regimes ." *Research Reports*.
- Prabasmoro, Aquarini Priyatna. 2006. Kajian Budaya Feminis (Tubuh, Sastra, Dan Budaya Pop). Yogyakarta: Jalasutra.
- Prabasmoro, Aquarini Priyatna. 2013. "Feminisme Sebagai Tubuh, Pemikiran Dan Pengalaman." *Journal of Chemical Information and Modeling* 53(9):1689– 99. doi: 10.1017/CBO9781107415324.004.
- Reed, T. V. 2014. Digitized Lives: Culture, Power, and Social Change in the Internet Era.
- Rogers, Mary F. 1996. *Barbie Culture Ikon Budaya Konsumerisme*. Yogyakarta: Bentang Budaya.
- Royal, Cindy Louise. 2005. "Gendered Spaces and Digital Discourse : Framing Women's Relationship with the Internet."
- Seawright, Max. 2014. "Beauty, Violence, Representation." *Visual Studies* 30(1):1. doi: DOI: 10.1080/1472586X.2014.887311.

- Swami, Viren, Jakob Pietschnig, Natasha Stewart, Ingo W. Nader, Stefan Stieger, Samantha Shannon, and Martin Voracek. 2013. "Blame It on Patriarchy: More Sexist Attitudes Are Associated with Stronger Consideration of Cosmetic Surgery for Oneself and One's Partner." *International Journal of Psychology* 48(6). doi: 10.1080/00207594.2012.740566.
- Synnott, Anthony. 1993. *The Body Social: Symbolism, Self and Society*. London and New York: Routledge.
- Synnott, Anthony. 2002. *Tubuh Sosial. Simbolisme, Diri, Dan Masyarakat*. 1st ed. edited by M. H. Abid. Yogyakarta: Jalasutra.
- Walby, Sylvia. 1987. Patriarchy at Work: Patriarchal and Capitalist Relations in Employment. University of Minnesota Press.
- Walby, Sylvia. 1991. Theorizing Patriarchy. B. Blackwell.
- Walby, Sylvia. 1997. Gender Transformations. Routledge.
- Walby, Sylvia. 2009. *Globalization and Inequalities : Complexity and Contested Modernities.* SAGE Publications.
- Walby, Sylvia. 2011. The Future of Feminism. Polity Press.
- Weeks, David M., and J. Regan Thomas. 2014. "Beauty in a Multicultural World." Facial Plastic Surgery Clinics of North America 22(3):337–41. doi: 10.1016/j.fsc.2014.04.005.
- Wellman, Barry, and Milena Gulia. 1999. "Communities and Cyberspace,."
- Wolf, Naomi. 2002. The Beauty Myth: How Images of Beauty Are Used Against Women. New York: Harper Collins Publisher.
- Wulan, Roro Retno. 2017. "The Myth of White Skin: A Postcolonial Review of Cosmetics Ads in Indonesia." 00048.