Indonesian Journal of Sport Law
Vol. 02 No. 01 Tahun 2025
https://journal.unesa.ac.id/index.php/ijsl
e-ISSN : 30906156

LEGAL REVIEW OF UMPIRE'S DECISION IN ENGLAND VS NEW ZEALAND CRICKET FINAL

Ade Putra Hasibuan [1], Vikas Kumar Chaudhary [2]

[1,2]University of Lucknow, India
putrahasby61@gmail.com

ABSTRACT

The Cricket is a game played by 2 (two) antagonistic teams that can be played by anyone, both young and old. Cricket means a game that is almost similar to softball and baseball. Cricket does not mean an individual game but a team game. Each team consists of 11 people so that there is cooperation between players to produce victory. Cricket is a sport that originated in England, cricket has been very popular in British colonies such as India, Pakistan, Australia, Malaysia and others. For those who are new to cricket, this sport uses a bat, stump, ball and field. However for matches such as the final, there must be an additional match so that the rules of international matches need to be changed. What are the Cricket rules that should be changed and considered to neutralize the laws, which currently tend towards batsman? The ICC should do something about the bails. During the Indian Premier League (IPL) as well as the World Cup, so many times we have seen that bails are not falling despite ball hit the stumps. It should not be like that. In an event like the world cup, it happened 5 times so far in the first ten days. Nothing can be more frustrating for a bowler than this. There are a few things that I think can resolve this issue.

Keywords : Cricket; Umpires Decision; International Cricket Council

1. Introduction

Cricket is a team sport played between two teams of eleven players each. The modern form of cricket originated in England, and is popular in Commonwealth countries. In some South Asian countries, such as India, Pakistan and Sri Lanka, cricket is the most popular sport. Cricket is also an important sport in England and Wales, Australia, New Zealand, South Africa, Zimbabwe and the English speaking Caribbean.[1]

Cricket is a game played with a bat and a ball. The object of the game is to score more runs than the other team. A game of cricket can last up to five days and can last six hours or more each day. Cricket is one of the national summer sports of England which is also played around the world, especially in Australia, India, Pakistan, the West Indies and the British Isles. Cricket is a sport played with a bat and a ball. This sport involves two opposing teams with each team having 11 players. Each of the eleven

[1] Birley, Derek (1999). *A Social History of English Cricket*. Aurum. ISBN 1-85410-710-0

players must score in order to win the match.

Cricket matches are played on an oval field with a square area in the middle called the pitch. The pitch is 20.12 meters long and 3.04 meters wide. Cricket matches are played by one of the team members having to hit the ball until it passes the specified boundary. Then he runs between two sets of three small wooden poles or called wickets located at each end of the pitch.

Based on historical facts, the origin of cricket is not known for certain. Cricket comes from a game called *Creag* which was known after the Roman Empire. In the past this game was played by *Prince Edward, Earl of Wessex* England. In addition some also say that cricket comes from a sport called *Creckett* which was played in 1598. Two centuries after its initial appearance cricket finally got public attention.

Quoting from the book entitled A History of Cricket Volume I, the first country to start a cricket match was England in the mid-16th century.[2] Then cricket spread world-wide to British colonies in the mid-19th century. Cricket began to be spread widely to various parts of the world by soldiers at military bases, especially those guarding British colonies. It is only natural that cricket is increasingly popular in former British colonies namely Malaysia, Singapore, Pakistan, India and Sri Lanka. From here, this cricket sport entered the international competition officially developed by England.[3]

Cricket is a sport that can be played by all groups of people both teenagers and the general public, demands higher achievements, even national and international championships have often been held. Cricket is a sport played in teams on a grass field that can be played by anyone both teenagers and the general public who prioritize honesty, honor and obey the referee decision.

2. Methods

Method is one of the key elements in discussing a problem, where the research method is an approach aimed at systematically and consistently revealing the truth and solving problems in order to achieve the final result. The method applied in this study is a qualitative method.[4] Qualitative research refers to the process of exploring and

---

2 H. S. Altham. (1962). *A History of Cricket Volume I*., Hardcover, January 1, 1962.
3 McCann, Tim (2004). *Sussex Cricket in the Eighteenth Century*. Sussex Record Society.
4 Benuf, K., and Muhamad Azhar. (2020). *Legal Research Methodology as an Instrument for Analyzing Contemporary Legal Problems*. Jurnal Gema Keadilan, (Online), 7(1): 20-33

understanding the meaning of individual behavior so that when the final match between England and New Zealand, where when the scores of both teams are the same a super over is played.

In the super over, the scores are also the same so in the final decision, the team that managed to score the most fours is declared the winner. However for matches such as the final, there must be an additional match so that the rules of international matches need to be changed. What are the Cricket rules that should be changed and considered to neutralize the laws, which currently tend towards batsman?

3. Result and Discussion

Cricket is a game played with a bat and a ball. The object of the game is to score more runs than the other team. A game of cricket can last up to five days and can last six hours or more each day. Cricket reached its golden age in the two decades before the First World War.

During that golden age cricket produced the best players who are remembered until now such as William Gilbert Grace and Sir Donald George Bradman.[5] Reporting from Cricket: A History of its Growth and Development, Eyre & Spottiswoode, a board or governing body for international cricket was formed, called the International Cricket Council (ICC).[6]

The cricket board has more than 100 member countries and 12 of them are full members who play test matches. The rules of the cricket game itself are held in the Laws of Cricket code owned and managed by the Marylebone Cricket Club (MCC) in London. Currently the ICC has its headquarters in Dubai, United Arab Emirates. The ICC has the task of organizing and coordinating the international cricket championship event or Cricket World Cup.[7]

The International Cricket Council (ICC), headquartered in Dubai that the global governing body for cricket. The ICC was founded in 1909 as the Imperial Cricket Conference, renamed the International Cricket Conference in 1965 and adopted its current name in 1989.

As of 2017 the ICC has 105 member nations, 12 of which hold full membership and can play Test cricket. The ICC is responsible for the organization and organization of international cricket tournaments such as the Cricket World Cup for men and for women.

---

5 George Allen & Unwin, London. Page 55-87

6 Rowland Bowen. (1970). *Cricket: a History of its Growth and Development: Throughout the World*.

7 Eyre & Spottiswoode. Hardcover. January 1, 1970. Page 144-149.

The ICC also appoints the umpires and referees who officiate all Test matches, Limited Overs Internationals and Twenty20 Internationals that it has sanctioned.

Each member country has a national cricket body which regulates the cricket matches played in the country, selects the national team and organizes tours for the national team. In the West Indies, which in cricket is considered a federation of

countries this matter is regulated by Cricket West Indies.[8]

The ICC is the global governing body for cricket. Representing 108 members, the ICC governs and administrates the game and works with our members to grow the sport. The ICC is also responsible for the staging of all ICC Events.

The ICC presides over the ICC Code of Conduct, playing conditions, the Decision Review System and other ICC regulations. The ICC also appoints all match officials that officiate at all sanctioned international matches. Through the Anti-Corruption Unit it coordinates action against corruption and match fixing.

Cricket owes much of its appeal and enjoyment to the fact that it should be played not only according to the laws but also within the Spirit of Cricket. The major responsibility for ensuring fair play rests with the captains but extends to all players, match officials especially in junior cricket, teachers, coaches and parents.

This is the first time that rules are known to have been formally agreed their purpose being to resolve any problems between the patrons during their matches. The concept that however was to attain greater importance in terms of defining rules of play as eventually, these were codified as the Laws of Cricket.

The Articles are a list of 16 points many of which are easily recognized despite their wording as belonging to the modern Laws of Cricket, for example a Ball caught, the Striker is out, when a Ball is caught out, the Stroke counts nothing and catching out behind the Wicket allowed.

Respect is central to the Spirit of Cricket:

1. Respect your captain, team-mates, opponents and the authority of the umpires.
2. Play hard and play fair.
3. Accept the umpire's decision.
4. Create a positive atmosphere by your own conduct, and encourage others to do

---

[8] Pont, Lan. (2010). *Coaching Youth Cricket*. July 1987. Amerika.

likewise.

5. Show self discipline even when things go against you.
6. Congratulate the opposition on their successes, and enjoy those of your own team.
7. Thanks the officials and your opposition at the end of the match, whatever the result.

Cricket is an exciting game that encourages leadership, friendship and teamwork, which brings together people from different nationalities, cultures and religions especially when played within the Spirit of Cricket.[9]



Picture. 1. The Referee's Decision in the Final Match between England vs New Zealand

In Law 42 about responsibility of umpires is the umpires shall be the sole judges of fair and unfair play. If we attention to the picture 1 (one) above it, if either umpire considers an action not covered by the laws, to be unfair he shall intervene without appeal and if the ball is in play, call and signal dead ball and implement the procedure as set out in 18 below of cricket law. Otherwise umpires shall not interfere with the progress of play without appeal except as required to do so by the laws. Dangerous and unfair bowling action by the umpire:

1. As soon as the bowler's end umpire decides under cricket law in article 6 (a) above that the bowling of fast short pitched balls has become dangerous and unfair, or,

[9] Delor, R. (2010). Cricket Steps to Success. United States of America: Human Kinetics. INC.

except as in 8 below, there is an instance of dangerous and unfair bowling as defined in 6 (a) above, he shall call and signal No ball. When the ball is dead, he shall caution the bowler, inform the other umpire, the captain of the fielding side and the batsmen of what has occurred. This caution shall apply throughout the innings.

2. If there is any further instance of dangerous and unfair bowling by the same bowler in that innings, the umpire shall repeat the above procedure and indicate to the bowler that this is a final warning. This warning shall also apply throughout the innings.
3. Should there be any further repetition by the same bowler in that innings, the umpire shall call and signal no ball as below:[10]
   a. When the ball is dead direct the captain to suspend the bowler forthwith and

      inform the other umpire of the reason for this action. The bowler thus suspended shall not be allowed to bowl again in that innings. If applicable, the over shall be completed by another bowler, who shall neither have bowled any part of the previous over nor be allowed to bowl any part of the next over.
   b. Additionally he shall report the occurrence to the batsmen and as soon as practicable to the captain of the batting side.
   c. Together with the other umpire report the occurrence as soon as possible after the match to the Executive of the fielding side and to any Governing Body responsible for the match, who shall take such action as is considered appropriate against the captain and bowler concerned

In the sport of cricket, understanding the basic rules is essential to appreciate the dynamics of the game. There are three main rules that form the foundation of the game: team rules, scoring, and field rules.

Each of these elements directs the course of the match and determines the strategies of the two competing teams. Let us explore these rules in more detail in the context of the challenging game of cricket.

1. Cricket Team Rules

---

[10] Brodribb, Gerald (1995). *Next Man In: A Survey of Cricket Laws and Customs*. London: Souvenir Press. ISBN 0-285-63294-9.

The basic rules of cricket involve two teams each consisting of 11 players. In this game one team will act as the bowling team, whose job is to throw the ball to the batsmen of the opposing team. The opposing team, acting as the batting team will try to hit the ball as hard as possible and score points.

Each innings of play consists of a series of bowls and during one over, the bowling team and the batting team try to score points or prevent points from being scored respectively. The changeover between the bowling team and the batting team occurs after the completion of a particular over or when ten players from the batting team have been out.

2. Cricket Score Calculation

   The basic rules of the game of cricket involve two main forms of scoring, namely runs and overs:

   a. Run (Point)

      Points or runs in cricket are scored by the batting team when their players successfully run a path between the two stumps at either end of the field. Each time a player successfully completes a path, the team is awarded a point.

      Points can also be scored by hitting the ball beyond the boundary of the field, which is called a boundary (four points) or a six (six points) if the ball directly crosses the boundary without touching the ground.

   b. Over

      An over is a unit of time in the game of cricket. Each over consists of six bowling balls taken by the bowling team. After an over is completed, the bowling team and the batting team switch. The score in an over reflects the number of bowling balls taken, and each player on the batting team tries to score as many points as possible during the over. The score in cricket reflects how well the batting team can run the runs and score points, while the bowling team tries to limit the points and take as many wickets as possible.

3. Cricket Ground Rules

   The basic rules of cricket involve an oval-shaped field with a playing area in the middle called the pitch. The pitch is the central area where the various actions of the game take place. The cricket field has two small poles or wickets at either end of the pitch.

On the pitch, the two small poles placed in the ground are called wickets. Each wicket consists of three vertical bars connected by two horizontal bars called stumps. The batting team players try to protect their wickets, while the bowling team players try to hit the wickets by throwing the ball.

Before the match two umpires shall be appointed, one for each and to control the match as required by the laws with absolute impartiality. The umpires shall be present on the ground and report to the Executive of the ground at least 45 minutes before the scheduled start of each days play.

An umpire shall not be changed during the match, other than in exceptional circumstances, unless he/she is injured or ill. If there has to be a change of umpire, the replacement shall act only as the strikers and umpire unless the captains agree that the replacement should take full responsibility as an umpire.

The umpires shall stand where they can best see any act upon which their decision may be required. Subject to this over-riding consideration, the bowlers and umpire shall stand in a position so as not to interfere with either the bowler run-up or the strikers view. The strikers and umpire may elect to stand on the off side instead of the on side of the pitch, provided he/she informs the captain of the fielding side the striker and the other umpire.

Consultation between umpires and scorers on doubtful points is essential. The umpires shall throughout the match, satisfy themselves as to the correctness of the number of runs scored, the wickets that have fallen and where appropriate the number of overs bowled. They shall agree these with the scorers at least at every interval, other than a drinks interval and at the conclusion of the match.

Two Important Reforms ICC Should Consider for Fairer Cricket. Cricket has evolved significantly with technology and strategy but certain changes especially in the ODI and T20 formats are causing imbalance and frustration, particularly for bowlers. Two key issues need urgent attention:

1. The Bails Must Fall Technology Should not Overpower the Basics. During high profile tournaments like the IPL and the World Cup, there have been multiple instances where the ball hits the stumps but the bails do not dislodge. This defies the fundamental principle of how a batsman is deemed bowled. In the first 10 days

of a recent World Cup, this anomaly occurred five times sparking frustration for bowlers and fans alike.

Possible Solutions is Reduce the Weight of LED Bails, Modern bails contain LEDs and battery components for better visual appeal and decision making. However they are heavier than traditional wooden bails. A redesign to make them lighter and slimmer could improve the chances of them falling. Shallower Grooves on Stumps: The grooves that hold the bails can be made less deep. Right now the snug fit prevents them from dislodging easily even on a solid hit.

Rely on LED Indicator Alone: Since the stumps and bails light up upon contact, perhaps that glowing signal should suffice to declare a batsman bowled. Requiring the bails to fall even after the LED activation seems redundant in an era of tech-enhanced umpiring.

2. Reconsider the Use of Two New Balls in ODIs. Since 2011, ODIs use two new balls (one from each end), meaning each ball is only 25 overs old by the end of an innings. This has significantly reduced reverse swing an essential skill for fast bowlers during the death overs.

Why this is a Problem: Lack of reverse swing makes it easier for batsmen to attack in the final overs. Bowlers have fewer tools at their disposal to counter power hitting, skewing the game balance.

Suggested Reform is Return to Using One Ball per Innings: This will allow bowlers to exploit swing and seam movement especially reverse swing in the later stages. It rewards skill and adds an exciting dimension to the endgame of an ODI match.

4. Conclusion

There is an appeal for LBW and umpire says not out. While reviewing the decision, if the ball tracker says that the ball is not fully hitting the stump or bells and since umpire has given him/her not out, original decision stays.

Technically the question is whether ball is hitting a stump/bells or not. How can you give someone not out even if ball is hitting the stump or bells? International rules

change if ball hit wicket then Batman is out whether umpire call is not out.

First of all, the ICC should do something about the bails. During IPL as well as the World

Cup, so many times we have seen that bails are not falling despite ball hit the stumps. It should not be like that. In an event like the world cup, it happened 5 times so far in the first ten days. Nothing can be more frustrating for a bowler than this. There are a few things that I think can resolve this issue.

The weight of the bails should be reduced. Since these days bails have LED in it, the necessary electrical equipment may be making it heavier. The bails can be thinner to reduce the weight. The groove over the stumps which hold the bails can be made less dipper.

Since the bails, as well as stumps have LED in it, it glows once the ball hit the stumps. This should be enough to decide the batsman is out or not. In that case, bails are not needed to be clipped off the stumps to decide a batsman is out or not.

The second suggestion would be to use one ball instead of two balls for the entire match. These day two new balls have been used in the ODI matches from the enlargement of an innings. As a result, when an innings is complete each ball is only 25 overs old. Thus the chances of reverse swing become very less. Instead of that if only one ball is used, later in the innings when the batsman tries to score faster, balls will start to show reverse swing which will give a bowler something more to fight.

Technology and format innovations are vital but they must not compromise the fairness or fundamental balance of the game. It is time the ICC reevaluates these issues to ensure cricket remains a true contest between bats and balls.

1. Heavy LED Bails That Do not Fall
   For an issue that in modern cricket especially in T20s and ODIs, LED bails often do not fall even when the stumps are clearly hit. Why it is wrong because this goes against the basic principle of being bowled. Bowlers are unfairly denied wickets. Suggested Change like Lighter bails, shallower grooves or count the LED light activation as enough for dismissal.
2. Two New Balls in ODIs
   For an issue since 2011, ODIs use two new balls one from each end. Each ball is used for only 25 overs. Why it is wrong because this reduces reverse swing, takes spin out of the game early and heavily favors batting in the death overs. Suggested Change like Return to one ball per innings to maintain balance between bat and ball.
3. No Free Hit for Test Matches

For an issue that free hit is only used in limited overs formats. Why it is

wrong because a no ball gives a huge advantage to the batting side in T20s/ODIs but not in Tests. Bowlers escape penalty in the longest format. Suggested Change like Consider introducing free hit for front foot no balls even in Tests.

4. Soft Ball After 34-35 Overs in ODIs

   For an issue in ODIs even with two balls, they start losing hardness around 30–35 overs. Why it is wrong because a softer ball helps neither swing nor seam and turns death overs into purely battings showcases. Suggested Change like Improve ball durability or allow one supervised ball change after 35 overs.

5. Umpire's Call in LBW Decisions

   For an issue that even when the ball is hitting the stumps, the decision may stay not out due to umpires call. Why it is wrong because this creates confusion and frustration. Suggested Change like either eliminate umpires call or redefine its use. If the ball is hitting the stumps, it should be out.

6. Boundary Count Rule (Super Over Tie)

   For an issue that in the 2019 World Cup final, England won based on more boundaries after the Super Over was tied. Why it is wrong because it is an arbitrary tiebreaker for such a big match. Suggested Change like use multiple Super Overs until a clear winner emerges.

7. Timed Out Rule (Poor Clarity)

   For an issue that Angelo Mathews was timed out in the 2023 World Cup in a controversial decision. Why it is wrong because the rule lacks clarity for practical situations like equipment malfunction. Suggested Change like add reasonable exceptions and clear guidelines for timed out dismissals.

Acknowledgments

The authors would like to express their sincere gratitude to all individuals and institutions who have supported to all individuals and institutions who have supported the preparation of this research. Special appreciation is extended to the Faculty of Law, Universitas Negeri Surabaya, Indonesia, and the Faculty of Law, University of Lucknow, India, for providing an academic environment that supports scholarly collaboration and

research development. The authors also acknowledge the valuable contributions and support received during the research and preparation of this article. Any remaining errors or shortcomings are the sole responsibility of the authors.

References

Ref Benuf, K., and Muhamad Azhar. (2020). Legal Research Methodology as an Instrument for Analyzing Contemporary Legal Problems. Jurnal Gema Keadilan, (Online), 7(1): 20-33 https://doi.org/10.14710/gk.2020.7504

Birley, Derek (1999). A Social History of English Cricket. Aurum. ISBN 1-85410-710-0

H. S. Altham. (1962). A History of Cricket Volume I., Hardcover, January 1, 1962.

George Allen & Unwin, London. Page 55-87

Pont, Lan. (2010). Coaching Youth Cricket. July 1987. Amerika.

McCann, Tim (2004). Sussex Cricket in the Eighteenth Century. Sussex Record Society.

Rowland Bowen. (1970). Cricket: a History of its Growth and Development: Throughout the World.

Eyre & Spottiswoode. Hardcover. January 1, 1970. Page 144-149.

Brodribb, Gerald (1995). Next Man In: A Survey of Cricket Laws and Customs. London: Souvenir Press. ISBN 0-285-63294-9.

Delor, R. (2010). Cricket Steps to Success. United States of America: Human Kinetics. INC.