

Article info:

Indonesia

E-mail:

Received: 05 December 2022

*Corresponding author: Moh. Sarjoko, Music Study Program,

Faculty of Languages and

Arts Universitas Negeri

Surabaya, Surabaya,

sarjoko@unesa.ac.id

Reviewed: 25 January 2023

Accepted: 25 June 2023

Subject of Main Instruments (Violin) Madya Level Course In Music Study Program, Faculty of Languages and Arts, Universitas Negeri Surabaya

Moh Sarjoko

Universitas Negeri Surabaya

Abstract: Soprano violin is part of a stringed instrument. Today, the violin is one of the most popular musical instruments in the community. Many people learn this violin instrument in studios, music courses, schools and other educational institutions. Therefore, the need for the availability of this violin instrument is guite a lot. This also has an impact on the needs of teachers/tutors, the need for books/tools to support the ability to play the violin, and so on. Music Study Program, Faculty of Languages and Arts, Universitas Negeri Surabaya is one of the educational institutions where many students choose the violin major specialization. This research is a class action research at the intermediate level elective principal instrument subject using the case study method through direct observation of the level of difficulty and suitability of the material, so that it can produce a book output. This book is a guide in learning the violin musical instrument which is equipped with techniques, scales, etudes, and repertoire for students of the Music Study Program, Faculty of Languages and Arts, Universitas Negeri Surabaya who are taking the subject matter of violin at the intermediate level.

Keywords: development, textbooks, violin, intermediate

1. INTRODUCTION

Art education is one of the scientific fields in the world of education related to aesthetic education. It is said so, because the implementation of arts education includes several important aspects. These aspects include creativity, skill, and sensitivity. This is reinforced by the opinion of Hajar Pamadhi (2012:3), that art education is a means of developing children's creativity and aesthetic education which aims to restore education to a sense of beauty. Art education needs to be implemented in various scopes of educational institutions, bearing in mind the depletion of children's sense of sensitivity and creativity in Indonesia at this time.

Music education is one of the most important parts of implementing art education. This is reinforced by Plato's opinion (in Djohan Salim, 2005:175) which reveals that "In education, music occupies the highest position because there is no single scientific discipline that can penetrate the soul and accompany it with tiered abilities beyond rhythm and harmony". Based on this opinion, a view can be drawn that music education is the only scientific discipline that trains sensitivity to taste and soul. Music education in its implementation is education that trains and cultivates sensitivity through things that are often found in playing music. This sense of sensitivity can be in the form of playing music activities in feeling



harmony, rhythm, melody, and tempo. The implementation of music education in Indonesia can be seen from various levels of education, both formal, non-formal and informal education levels. The level of higher education is one level of formal education that implements music learning.

Universitas Negeri Surabaya is one of the levels of formal education within the scope of higher education that implements music education. One of the implementations of music education can be seen from several study programs at Universitas Negeri Surabaya that offer musical expertise. Universitas Negeri Surabaya is one of the largest state universities in East Java. Universitas Negeri Surabaya has 7 Faculties, namely the Faculty of Languages and Arts, Faculty of Education, Faculty of Sports Science, Faculty of Postgraduate, Faculty of Economics, Faculty of Engineering, Faculty of Social Sciences and Law, and Faculty of Mathematics and Natural Sciences. These faculties gave birth to various study programs with various expertise. The Faculty of Languages and Arts is one of the faculties at Universitas Negeri Surabaya which has produced various study programs in the fields of Languages and Arts. The music study program is one of the study programs in the Faculty of Languages and Arts.

The music study program is one of the new study programs at the Faculty of Languages and Arts, Universitas Negeri Surabaya. This study program was established in 2015 with 9 teaching staff or lecturers. This study program has graduated several graduates in 2019 and 2020. In addition, from year to year this study program has also shown its existence through various awards and achievements of its students at the local, national and international levels. The increase in the number of students enrolling from year to year also shows the existence of this study program. Meanwhile, this study program is also the only (pure) music arts study program in East Java that is based on classical music. The curriculum structure in this study program offers a variety of very interesting practical and theoretical courses.

The practical courses offered in this music study program are very diverse. In addition, in practice courses there are also instrument specializations that must be mastered by students. The instrument specialities are classified as wind, string, percussion, vocals, and guitar. The specialization of these instruments is also very diverse, such as stringed instruments consisting of soprano (violin), alto (viola), cello, and contra bass. String instrument specialization (violin) is implemented through the subject of string instruments.

The subject of string instrument also has various levels in the curriculum structure of the Music Study Program. The levels in the curriculum are the main sensory level instruments, youth level, middle level, and primary level. Meanwhile, the course is also divided into 3 classes, namely violin specialization (soprano violin, viola specialization (alto violin), cello specialization, and contrabass specialization. This practical course is usually held face-to-face once a week with a load of 3 credits and a duration of 150 minutes.

The subject of string instrument (violin) course at the intermediate level is held in semester 4. Based on the preliminary studies that have been carried out through observation or observation, the skills or abilities possessed by one student are very different from another. This difference can be seen from the ability of students who play scales, etudes, and repertoire. Each student taking part in the course plays scales, etudes, and repertoire at different levels. This is caused by many factors, including ineffective training duration, inappropriate individual learning methods, and so on. Therefore, the lecturers apply creative learning strategies. Like students who are already good in terms of skills and abilities, then the lecturer gives scales, etudes, and pieces of songs that are adapted to these skills. Students who have less skills or abilities, these students must work hard to improve their skills or abilities in catching up with their friends who already have good provisions or skills. Therefore, lecturers usually provide several alternative scales, etudes, and songs to students who are lacking in skills.

Based on the preliminary studies that have been carried out, that scales, etudes, and songs given by lecturers to students who have zero skills or the violin learning stage are not effective enough in improving skills or abilities with fast progress. Of course, this is also caused by other factors, namely ineffective training duration, inappropriate individual learning methods, and so on. In addition, the condition of the Covid-19 pandemic which requires students to study from home via online is currently making progress in improving students' abilities or skills also not visible significantly. This is also due to the nature of practical courses that must be carried out through face-to-face mentoring so an effective learning module is needed that is adapted to current conditions. Meanwhile, the idea of the Ministry of Education and Culture of Higher Education which required tertiary institutions to implement an independent learning curriculum had an impact on students who were required to learn quickly and effectively.

The constraints and problems that exist in the process of lecturing on the string instrument (violin) at the intermediate level at the present time have a major influence on the development of students' abilities and skills. Therefore, this study tries to present an alternative or new formula for learning modules that are effective and adapted to the current situation through the middle-level violin subject matter module which is complemented by a video tutorial module. Based on this description, this study was intended to develop and test the effectiveness and quality of the modules for the violin subject matter at the intermediate level.

Based on the description of the background that has been put forward, the formulation of the problem is described as follows: How is the development of the violin principal module at the intermediate level in the Music Study Program, Universitas Negeri Surabaya?, How is the effectiveness of the violin principal module at the intermediate level in the Program Music Studies, Universitas Negeri Surabaya?

2. METHODS

2.1 Types of Research

The type of research used in this research is Research and Development (RnD). Research and development or Research and Development (RnD) is a strategy or research method that is effective enough to improve practice (Nana Syaodih Sukmadinata, 2006:164). This research was conducted for one year.

2.2 Research Locations and Research Settings

The research location was carried out in Surabaya. This research will involve students of the Sendratasik Education Study Program and the Music Study Program class of 2021. The research setting is carried out via the zoom platform. This is because at this time it is still in the condition of the covid-19 pandemic which causes everyone to work and study from home.

2.3 Development Type

The type of research used in this research is development research, by developing product modules that contain techniques for playing stringed instruments (violin) which are applied to product needs for lecture teaching materials. Students are encouraged to read when they want to know the basic techniques of playing a string instrument (violin), in the sense that students in carrying out string instrument (violin) practice activities refer to learning modules that are made so that they are in accordance with good and proper training guidelines and procedures. Students can improve skills or abilities in playing string instruments (violin) with this learning module.

2.4 Development Style

The development research model usedis the ADDIE Learning Design Model (Analysis-Design-Develop-Implement-Evaluate) on the basis of the consideration that the model is applied to develop model products system-oriented instructional to produce a learning targeted, effective and dynamic. In accordance with the opinion of Mollenda (2003:35), that the design of the ADDIE model serves to guide the building tools and infrastructure for effective learning programs, dynamic, and support the learning performance itself. In addition, evaluation on the ADDIE model can also be applied to all stages. It will be useful for perfecting a lesson because there is always something to do improved in every progress. As for the development steps, as follows:

2.4.1 Analyze

The analysis phase is a needs assessment process, identify problems and perform analysis task. The resulting output is in the form of characteristics or student profiles, identification of needs and detailed task analysis based on need. The needs analysis stage is carried out to obtain information needed in planning the form of modules for junior level string instrument (violin) courses. At this stage, there are 2 steps carried out by researchers, namely literature study and study field. The explanation of the two steps is as follows:

2.4.1.1 Field Study

In field studies, researchers conducted preliminary observations at the Music Study Program, Universitas Negeri Surabaya to find information about the learning process in the implementation of the principal string instrument (violin) course at the middle level and other activities that held.

2.4.1.2 Literature Review

In this literature study, the researcher took material from the book relating to string instruments (violin), learning, and student characteristics.

2.4.2 Design

This stage is known as making a design.

2.4.2.1 Development Planning

This research raises the issue of learning in the implementation of the principal string instrument (violin) course at the middle level. After making initial observations, then the information that has been collected is used as a basis for product development. In this case, the researcher determines the competencies to be achieved and preparing infrastructure facilities that support learning in the implementation of the principal string instrument (violin) course at the middle level.

2.4.2.2 Initial Product Design

Product design is the process of designing a product that will developed. In this case, the learning design in the implementation of the violin principal instrument course at the middle level is adjusted to the characteristics and abilities student of music study program, Universitas Negeri Surabaya.

2.4.3 Development

Development the process of embodiment of the design into reality, where at this stage everything that is needed or will support learning process everything must be prepared.

2.4.3.1 Instrument validation

At this stage, the researcher presents a validator to give suggestions for the instrument to be used. The instrument validator is Agus Suwahyono, S.Sn., M.Pd. He is a Lecturer in the Music Study Program, Faculty of Languages and Arts, Universitas Negeri Surabaya. Once done validation, instrument revision was carried out. Instrument revision based on the results of comments and suggestions from the validator in measuring output to be achieved through the instrument. The instrument used is the Skills Test for Playing Musical Instruments (Soprano Violin). The test instrument, assessment criteria, and scoring rubric are attached.

2.4.3.2 Product Validation

At this stage, researchers present experts to assess the product. After being validated by experts, the design was revised. Design revision based on comments and suggestions from good experts in the content of the material as well as in measuring the output to be achieved through the product. The validator team is as follows:

1) Test the validity of the content and presentation feasibility components. For content and presentation feasibility components, the validator who plays a role is Harpang Yudha Karyawanto, S.Pd., M.Pd. He is a Lecturer in the Music Study Program as a lecturer in the subject of string instruments (violin and viola) at the Faculty of Languages and Arts, Universitas Negeri Surabaya. Besides being active as a teacher, Harpang Yudha Karyawanto, S.Pd., M.Pd. also active as a music practitioner, observer, and judge of music competitions in Indonesia, particularly in East Java.

2) Test the validity of the language feasibility component. The validator whose role is for the language feasibility component is Hespi Septiana, S.Pd., M.Pd. She is a lecturer in Indonesian at the Indonesian Language Department, Faculty of Languages and Arts, Universitas Negeri Surabaya. She is also active in language studies and BIPA.

3) Test the validity of the graphical feasibility component. Referring to the purpose of the product produced in this study is in the form of a module for the subject of string instrument (violin) at the junior level, then regarding the graphic component which includes aspects of legibility, and the design will be validated by Muh Ariffudin Islam. He is a lecturer in Visual Communication Design, Faculty of Languages and Arts, Universitas Negeri Surabaya who is also active as a product designer, active as a national and international jury in design until now.

2.4.3.3 Validation Indicator

There are several components that are the main points in the process of testing the validity of the Middle Level String Instrument (violin) Module Development Course, including (Development Product Validity Test Sheet):

- 1) Content and Presentation Feasibility Components
- 1.1) Conformity between violin instrument material in the Middle Level Basic String Instrument (violin) Course and the Curriculum in the Music Study Program.
- 1.2) The material used in the Intermediate Level Principal String Instrument (violin) Course Module includes an understanding of scales, violin playing techniques, etudes, and song repertoire in stages.
- 1.3) The song material in the book can be applied independently by students of the Middle Level (student-centered) Principal Class of String Instruments (violin) Course.

- 1.4) The reference material used in the Middle Level String Instrument (violin) Course Module can be applied to the present.
- 1.5) The title shown in the Middle Level String Instrument (violin) Course Module corresponds to the overall concept of the song material.
- 1.6) The material is presented in a coherent, gradual manner, and can direct students' understanding into the learning process of the subject matter for Middle Level String Instruments (violin) Subject gradually.
- 1.7) The Young Level String Instrument (violin) Course Module is presented in full, starting from the introductory section, table of contents, appropriate text size and according to standards.
- 2) Language Feasibility Components
- 2.1) The grammar used is easily understood by students.
- 2.2) The grammar used is in accordance with Enhanced Spelling.
- 2.3) The systematics of writing for the Middle Level String Instrument Course (violin) is in accordance with the rules for writing learning material books.
- 3) Graphical Feasibility Components
- 3.1) Regarding the book cover design.
- 3.2) Readability aspect (easy to understand)
- 3.3) Quality of print (images as well as musical notation)
- 3.4) The physical strength of the book (regarding the paper material used)

2.4.3.4 Limited Trial

Preliminary trials conducted on several subjects to find out product capabilities in learning. The subject consists of 9 people students who are not students of the music study program, Universitas Negeri Surabaya.

2.4.3.5 Limited Trial Revision

Fixed and refined the trial results after revise the design and conduct product trials, then step next is to revise the product according to the data obtained from supporting lecturers who conduct product trials.

2.4.4 Implementation

Implementation is a real step to implement the system learning that is being developed. That is, at this stage all that has been developed, installed, or customized accordingly role or function in order to be implemented. After the product is ready, then can be piloted through large groups then evaluated and revised. Trials can be conducted on large groups later re-evaluated and revised. This stage is called the revision of Field Test Results (Implementation), namely product improvement is the final stage after product trials were carried out. This stage is carried out based on comments and suggestions given by product experts to researchers.

2.4.5 Evaluation

Evaluation is a process to see whether learning in the implementation of the subject of the string instrument (violin) that is being built is successful, according to initial expectations or not. The evaluation stage can be carried out at any of the four stages above which are called formative evaluation, because its purpose is for revision needs. At stage our design requires expert review to provide input onthe plans we are making. Meanwhile, a summative evaluation will be carried out at the end of learning that has been passed with several revision processes so as to produce a decent final product.

2.5 Data Collection Technique

2.5.1 Documentation

Documentation is done to complete the data. This documentation data collection technique is carried out by collecting biographical data and videos relating to the practice of the principal violin instrument at the Intermediate level in the Music Study Program to complete the needs analysis in a development. In addition, documentation techniques are also used to complement observation needs with the aim of minimizing what is missed in the observer's memory.

2.5.2 Observation

Observation is assisted by an observation sheet that is used to measure violin playing skills using a performance assessment observation sheet.

2.6. Data Collection Instruments

Measurement of learning outcomes assessment uses non-test instruments to evaluate learning outcomes in the form of motor skills. The form of assessment that uses non-test instruments in this study is product assessment, namely through observation sheets for performance appraisal in the form of skills. In addition, an assessment rubric is also provided as a guide for a more accurate assessment. The instrument used is in the form of an observation sheet which is divided into two types according to the form of the assessment, namely:

2.6.1 Product Assessment Instrument for Experts

This instrument is in the form of mixed assessment sheets, namely open and closed, which are prepared for product assessment by experts, with the aim of obtaining data regarding the feasibility of learning modules.

The evaluation criteria use a Likert scale to measure expert opinion on the product being developed. The scoring system is: Very Good (5), Good (4), Enough (3), Poor (2), and Very Poor (1). The comments and suggestions section is to complete if there is input from what has been developed so that it can be considered for product revisions if necessary.

2.6.2 Skills Assessment Instrument

The performance appraisal instrument in this study is the observation sheet. This instrument was developed to obtain data regarding skills assessment. This method of assessment is considered more authentic than the written test because what is assessed reflects the student's true abilities. This observation sheet is used in pre-learning, during the learning process, and at the end of learning.

The evaluation criteria use a Likert scale to measure expert opinion on the product being developed. The scoring system is: Very Good (5), Good (4), Enough (3), Poor (2), and Very Poor (1). The comments and suggestions section is to complete if there is input from what has been developed so that it can be considered for product revisions if necessary. between the experimental group and the control group there is a significant difference, it can be said that the treatment or treatment in the form of learning using this learning module has a significant effect. When the posttest is completed, the next step is data analysis and interpretation of the results of the research data.

The data analysis technique used is the t test. Descriptive analysis was carried out to present data obtained from the results of the pretest and posttest in the experimental group and the control group, while the t test was to measure the results of product application in the form of changes in skills in playing the soprano violin. Before using data analysis techniques with the t test, several requirements are needed in this study. The requirements include that the data must be normally distributed and the variance of the experimental group data must be homogeneous.

2.6.2.1 Descriptive Analysis

Descriptive analysis was used to present data obtained from the results of the pretest and posttest in the experimental group and the control group. Data from the music playing skills test through non-test instruments. Data is presented in tabular form in the form of mean, median, mode, standard deviation, variance, minimum score, maximum score, and graphs. This descriptive analysis was calculated using the help of Microsoft Excel and SPSS 23.0 software programs. The measurement results of all items and aspects of each variable are divided into 5 criteria.

2.6.2.2 Test Prerequisite Analysis

The analysis prerequisite test was used to determine whether the data from the two groups, namely the experimental group and the control group, were normally distributed and had a homogeneous data variance. The prerequisite analysis test is a prerequisite test that is used before entering the hypothesis test, namely the t test. The analysis prerequisite tests are the normality test and homogeneity test.

2.6.2.3 t test

Tests for normality and homogeneity obtained from the results of the pretest and posttest indicate that the data distribution is normal and homogeneous. Therefore, further hypothesis testing is carried out. The test used to analyze research data as well as test the hypothesis is the t test. This different test was used to determine significant differences in violin playing skills in the control group and the experimental group simultaneously.

3. RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

3.1 Results

The product used in this research and development consists of 5 steps, namely: 1) Analysis; 2) Design; 3) Development; 4) Implementation; and 5) Evaluation. Initial product development results consist of analysis steps to development. The results of these steps are:

3.1.2 Analysis Results

At this stage, there were 2 steps carried out by researchers, namely a literature study and a field study conducted in May 2021. The field study aims to determine the condition of the music study program, students, facilities and infrastructure, as well as to analyze the needs of lecturers and students in the learning process. The method used in this stage is observation. Observations were made at the research location, namely the Music Study Program, Faculty of Languages and Arts, Universitas Negeri Surabaya. Observations were made on students from the music arts study program who took a violin major, a total of 9 people, as test subjects. The aspects observed were the availability of facilities and infrastructure to support activities in learning violin instrument practice at the junior level, student conditions, student activities, and study program conditions in general.

Based on the results of observations, it can be concluded that there are 9 students taking the subject of string instrument (violin) at the Intermediate level with different skills in playing music. There are 3 students who play the violin with a higher level/grade. Meanwhile, students who played the violin at a basic level/grade were 6 people. All students who take part in this lecture have violins and standparts. In addition, the music studio used in this lecture is very supportive. This can be seen from the music studio which is set up with soundproofing and air-conditioned rooms. During the Covid-19 pandemic, this practical course was carried out via the Zoom-Meeting platform with a load of 3 credits and a duration of 150 minutes. The results of this literature study are used to convey material in a way that is appropriate to the ability level and characteristics of students. Another thing is that it is used as the basis for preparing textbook/module material.

3.2 Discussion

To analyze the output in the form of violin playing skills from the use of the developed product, the t test is used. Before using data analysis techniques with the t test, several requirements are needed in this study. The requirements include that the data must be normally distributed and the variance of the data must be homogeneous. Tests for normality and homogeneity obtained from the results of the pretest and posttest indicate that the data distribution is normal and homogeneous. Therefore, the t test is then carried out. The t test used to analyze the research data is the free sample test. This different test was used to determine significant differences in violin playing skills between students who were taught using the developed product and did not use the product simultaneously. The calculation of this t test uses Levene's Test and is calculated using the SPSS 23.0 software program. The decision criterion (Pallant, 2010:287) is if the significance value is <0.05, it can be concluded that there is a significant difference between groups on the dependent variable. The t test is divided into 2 stages of analysis which are described as follows:

3.2.1 Pretest t Test

The first stage of analysis is the pretest t test. This t-test was conducted to find out whether there was a difference in the mean of the experimental group and the control group in terms of students' violin playing skills during the pretest. As for the results of the t test from the average of the experimental group and the control group during the pretest. It is known that the results of the t test in the experimental group and the control group during the pretest with a significance value of 0.84. The significance value shows > 0.05, so it can be said that there is no difference in the pretest results of students' violin playing skills between the experimental group and the control group. In other words, the results of the pretest of violin playing skills in the experimental group and the control group were the same. Based on the results of the pretest t test, it can be concluded that there is no significant difference in the violin playing skills of students who are taught using the developed product and students who are not taught with the product. More complete information regarding the results of the ttest data pretest can be found in the appendix.

The next stage of analysis is the posttest t test. This t-test was conducted to find out whether there was a difference in the mean of the experimental group and the control group in terms of students' violin playing skills during the posttest. As for the results of the t test from the average of the experimental group and the control group during the posttest. From this, it is known that the results of the t test in the experimental group and the control group at the posttest with a significance value of 0.000. The significance value shows <0.05, so it can be said that there are differences in the posttest results of students' violin playing skills between the experimental group and the control group. In other words, the results of the posttest of students' violin playing skills in the experimental group and the control group were different. Based on the results of the posttest t test, it can be concluded that there is a significant difference in the violin playing skills of students who are taught using the product developed and students who are taught not using the product developed.

4. CONCLUSION

Based on the results of the progress of research and development that has been carried out, several conclusions can be drawn as follows: The development of the violin principal instrument learning module at the Madya level begins with conducting a needs analysis, namely observation, field study, and literature study. Product manufacturing is carried out through the stages of analysis, design, development, implementation, and evaluation at each stage. Next, an analysis of the effectiveness of the product is carried out through the t test. Based on the results of field studies in the form of observations, it was found that scales, etudes, and songs given by lecturers to students who had just reached the basic level were not effective enough in improving skills or abilities with fast progress. Meanwhile, the results of a field study in the form of a literature study found that the material to be used in this research and development was violin instrument practice including scales, violin playing techniques, etudes, and song repertoire.

Based on the design results in the form of development planning results, it was found that the competencies to be achieved in the violin lessons at the young level were students being able to play scales, violin playing techniques, etudes, and song repertoires well. Meanwhile, the results of the initial product design were in the form of compiling materials, namely course reviews, scales, violin playing techniques, etudes, and song repertoires. It can be concluded that the product assessment instrument can be used to assess products that are being developed without any revisions. Meanwhile, based on the results of product validation by experts, it can be concluded that the product can be used for field trials with slight revisions, namely suggestions and input from the three validators. The result of the value of the material validator is 57, the language validator is 54, and the graphic validator is 53. Further product trials were carried out on 9 students of the Music study program. As for the evaluation based on the results of the limited trial and the lecturer's suggestion, namely the violin playing technique material needs to be added regarding tenuto, spiccato, and marcato techniques.

The suggestions from supervisors and product trials, the next stage is product revision. Product revision was carried out with the addition of the introduction of several violin playing techniques, namely the tenuto, marcato, and spiccato techniques. Some of these techniques can be used in students playing etudes and song repertoires. The discussion on the basic technique of playing the violin is intended so that students can understand the technique of playing the violin written in block notation so that students can play



it with the violin and repertoire of songs correctly so as to improve students' abilities or skills.

After product revision, the next stage is the final product review. At this stage, the resulting product was tested at the Music Study Program via a zoom-meeting platform with 5 subjects in the experimental group and 4 subjects in the control group. Based on the field test results, the resulting product was declared very feasible to implement. Thus, the objective of this research has been achieved, namely to produce a product in the form of a learning module for the Madya violin subject matter instrument course. In addition, the product was declared effective so that it could be used in learning the violin at the intermediate level with the same student characteristics. The product in the form of a learning module is declared effective because it can improve violin playing skills. This is indicated by a significance value in the t test of 0.000, so it can be said that the experimental group and the control group differ significantly.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

This research is fully supported by Universitas Negeri Surabaya Research Grant.

REFERENCES

John Salim. (2005). Music psychology. Yogyakarta: Best Publisher. Molenda, M. (2003). In search of the elusive ADDIE model. Performance improvements, 42(5), 34-36. Submitted for publication in A. Kovalchick & K. Dawson, Ed's, Educational Technology: An Encyclopedia. Copyright by ABC- Clio, Santa Barbara, CA.

Pallant, J. (2010). SPSS Survival Manual: A step by step guide to data analysis using the SPSS program. New York: McGraw Hill

Pamadi, Hajar (2012). Art education. Yogyakarta: UNY Press. Sukmadinata, 2006. Metode Penelitian Kualitatif. Bandung: Graha Aksara