



Evaluation of the ASN Talent Management Policy: A Case Study of the Surabaya City Education Office Based on the Mayor Regulation

Nur Arisah^{1*}, Filda Putri Alis², Niken Ade Herlina³

¹²³State Administration, State University of Surabaya, Indonesia

*Correspondence: E-mail: nur.22062@mhs.unesa.ac.id

ABSTRACT

Civil servant (ASN) talent management serves as a strategic instrument in bureaucratic reform, ensuring the provision of competent and professional human resources within local government. This study assesses the implementation of the ASN Talent Management Policy, as outlined in Surabaya Mayoral Regulation No. 30 of 2021, within the Surabaya City Education Office. Employing a qualitative case study approach, data were gathered through interviews and document analysis, subsequently analyzed using the CIPP (Context, Input, Process, Product) evaluation model. The findings reveal that the policy facilitates competency development, succession planning, and a merit-based career system. Nevertheless, challenges persist, including a top-down selection process, training that may not always align with job requirements, and administrative monitoring. Despite these limitations, the policy has yielded positive outcomes, such as talent pools, competency mapping, and enhanced employee competencies. The findings underscore the imperative of bolstering competency-based training and outcome-oriented evaluation to enhance the effectiveness of talent management.

ARTICLEINFO

Article History:
Submitted/Received 18/12/2025
First Revised 04/05/2026
Accepted 24/06/2026
Publication Date 25/06/2026

Keywords:
ASN talent management; public policy evaluation; CIPP model; local government; Surabaya City Education Office

1. INTRODUCTION

Talent management has become a crucial focus in public sector human resource management due to its strategic role in ensuring that government organizations have the appropriate competency capacity to fill critical positions and improve bureaucratic performance. International studies indicate that the implementation of talent management in the public sector faces unique challenges such as budget constraints, bureaucratic merit procedures, and the need to adapt to digitalization (Kravariti et al., 2023). Review research and case studies in various countries confirm that a systematic approach (talent identification, competency development, succession, and performance measurement) contributes to the sustainability of public organizations' capabilities (Kozjek, 2020). In Indonesia, empirical research highlights the implementation of talent management for State Civil Apparatus (ASN), emphasizing the importance of synchronizing national talent management policies (such as the Ministerial Regulation on Administrative and Bureaucratic Reform) with practices in local governments, so that the principles of merit and competency development are consistently maintained across various levels of the bureaucracy.

Regional regulations/mayoral regulations that adopt talent management principles (as derivatives of national policies) are important objects for understanding how normative policies

are transformed into daily administrative practices. Surabaya Mayoral Regulation Number 30 of 2021 is a concrete example, as it clearly regulates the civil servant talent management process within the Surabaya City Government, from the identification of potential employees, competency assessment, development plan development, to placement mechanisms and career paths as part of improving civil servant professionalism. Research on the implementation of talent management policies at the local government level shows mixed results. Some regions have succeeded in formulating technical guidelines and competency development programs, while others face obstacles such as limited human resource capacity, suboptimal personnel data, and budget constraints (Pramesti, 2023). Research on the governance of civil servant recruitment/selection and the placement of regional educators also emphasizes that harmonization between the provisions of the Mayoral Regulation and technical implementation is essential so that talent management does not remain a written policy, but its implementation is measurable. Therefore, Surabaya Mayoral Regulation No. 30/2021 is a relevant regulation for further evaluation regarding its implementation, level of effectiveness, and suitability to the needs of civil servant management in technical units.

The case of civil servants (PNS) within the Surabaya City Education Office exemplifies various practical challenges in the implementation of talent management, particularly concerning the consistency of policy implementation, the alignment of programs with employee competency requirements, and the integration of the talent mapping process into the career development system (Saragih, 2024). While Surabaya Mayoral Regulation Number 30 of 2021 clearly delineates the stages of talent identification, competency assessment, placement, and career development, several studies indicate that the implementation of talent management within the regional education sector continues to encounter obstacles such as limited implementation of competency-based assessments, a misalignment between organizational needs and individual capacity, and suboptimal succession mechanisms for structural and functional positions (Lestari, 2023). These conditions raise questions about the efficacy of talent management policy implementation, particularly in ensuring that all civil servants have equitable opportunities to develop competencies, enhance their careers, and improve performance in accordance with the city government's policy directives. Consequently, evaluating the implementation of talent management at the Surabaya City Education Office is imperative to scrutinize several key aspects, including:

1. To what extent have the civil servant competency identification and mapping instruments been implemented in accordance with the Mayor's Regulation procedures?
2. How is civil servant access to competency development programs such as education and training, coaching, mentoring, and competency assessments?
3. How is the integration of civil servants in succession planning, talent placement, and merit-based career patterns?
4. How effective is the monitoring and evaluation mechanism carried out by agencies regarding policy implementation.

Numerous studies on human resource management for civil servants in local governments underscore the significance of bolstering the talent pool system, integrating employee competency data, and allocating an adequate budget for talent development. This approach would enable the optimal achievement of the objectives outlined in Mayoral Regulation No. 30/2021, which aims to enhance the professionalism, competency, and performance of ASN (Lestari, 2023). Consequently, a study on the efficacy of the implementation of Mayoral Regulation No. 30/2021 through a case analysis of civil servants at the Surabaya City Education Office offers a valuable empirical contribution in assessing the policy's success, identifying implementation challenges, and ensuring that talent management genuinely supports improving the quality of civil servant resources within the city government (Hasibuan, 2022).

Research on civil servant (ASN) talent management has been extensively conducted across various local government institutions. One study conducted by Handayani (2023) examined the implementation of talent management as a means of developing professional civil servants within the Pontianak City Government. The study focused on the implementation of talent management policies and the utilization of information systems to support ASN talent management. The findings revealed that the Pontianak City Government had developed a Talent Management Information System that facilitated the identification and management of ASN talents. However, its implementation still encountered several challenges, particularly in optimizing competency mapping and employee career development. While the study provided an overview of talent management implementation at the local government level, it did not specifically investigate the effectiveness of policy implementation based on a particular regional regulation or its application within a specific government agency.

Another study was conducted by Muna and Suratman (2024) regarding the implementation of talent management through competency assessment for supervisory civil servants in the Pekalongan Regency Government. This research emphasized competency assessment as the primary instrument for ASN talent mapping. The results indicated that competency assessments had supported the identification of high-potential employees and facilitated the development of a talent pool. Nevertheless, the utilization of assessment results for career development and position placement had not been fully optimized due to challenges in integrating competency data with the personnel management system. The study focused solely on one stage of talent management, namely competency assessment, and therefore did not provide a comprehensive understanding of talent management implementation from talent identification to policy monitoring and evaluation.

Furthermore, a study conducted by Amalia and Zalukhu (2025) on the implementation of ASN talent management within local government institutions demonstrated that talent management practices across various regions in Indonesia continue to face significant challenges. The findings showed that not all local government institutions were adequately prepared to implement talent management systems effectively due to budget constraints, insufficient institutional support, and disparities in human resource capacities among regions. While the study provided a general overview of talent management implementation in Indonesia, it did not specifically investigate the implementation of talent management policies within a particular institution nor assess policy effectiveness based on applicable regional regulations.

Table 1. Comparison of Previous Studies and Research Contribution

Author	Research Fokus	Main Findings	Contribution of This Study
Handayani (2023)	Implementation of ASN talent management in Pontianak City Government	Talent Management Information System supports talent management implementation, but competency mapping and career development remain suboptimal.	This study evaluates talent management implementation based on a specific regional regulation using the CIPP evaluation model
Muna & Suratman (2024)	Competency assessment in ASN talent management in	Competency assessment supports talent mapping, but its utilization for career development is not yet optimal.	This study evaluates all stages of talent management, including

	Pekalongan Regency		identification, development, succession planning, and evaluation mechanisms.
Amalia & Zalukhu (2025)	ASN talent management implementation in local government institutions	Talent management implementation is constrained by budget limitations, institutional readiness, and human resource capacity.	This study focuses specifically on the implementation of Surabaya Mayor Regulation Number 30 of 2021 within the Surabaya City Education Office and provides a comprehensive policy evaluation.

Based on these previous studies, it can be observed that research on ASN talent management generally focuses on policy implementation, the utilization of information systems, and competency assessments as components of the talent management process. However, there remains a lack of research that specifically evaluates the implementation of talent management policies based on particular regional regulations while comprehensively examining all stages of talent management. In addition, studies investigating talent management implementation within the regional education sector, particularly in the Surabaya City Education Office, remain limited. This is noteworthy because the education sector possesses distinct human resource characteristics and requirements compared to other local government agencies, thereby necessitating appropriate talent management practices to support organizational objectives.

Therefore, this study aims to address this research gap by examining the implementation of Surabaya Mayor Regulation Number 30 of 2021 concerning Civil Servant Talent Management within the Surabaya City Government through a case study of the Surabaya City Education Office. This research not only investigates competency assessment and talent mapping but also comprehensively analyzes talent identification, competency development, succession planning, talent placement, and the monitoring and evaluation mechanisms implemented within the organization. Consequently, this study is expected to provide a more comprehensive understanding of the effectiveness of talent management policy implementation at the local government agency level while also serving as an evaluation tool and source of recommendations for the Surabaya City Government in enhancing the quality of public sector human resource management in a sustainable manner. The novelty of this study lies in its specific focus on evaluating the implementation of Surabaya Mayor Regulation Number 30 of 2021 within the Surabaya City Education Office, one of the local government agencies characterized by a diverse number and profile of civil servants. In addition, this research examines all stages of talent management in an integrated manner, ranging from talent identification to monitoring and evaluation. As such, it offers a more comprehensive understanding of the effectiveness of talent management policy implementation compared to previous studies, which have generally concentrated on only certain aspects of ASN talent management.

Policy Theory and Policy Evaluation

Sustainable Human Resource Management (Sustainable HRM) emphasizes the long term development, retention, and utilization of employee competencies to ensure organizational

sustainability. In the public sector, talent management functions as a strategic mechanism to maintain the continuity of human capital by ensuring that competent employees are identified, developed, and prepared for future leadership positions. From the perspective of Human Capital Theory, investments in competency development, succession planning, and talent retention contribute to improved organizational performance and institutional resilience. Therefore, evaluating ASN talent management is not only important for assessing policy effectiveness but also for understanding its contribution to sustainable human capital development within local government organizations. Public policy evaluation theory has shifted from traditional approaches that solely assess administrative outcomes to modern approaches that focus on policy impact, measurability, tangible benefits, and the learning process for policymakers. Modern evaluation serves as a strategic tool that not only assesses the success of a program but also helps understand its implementation process, identify structural barriers, and provide a basis for evidence based policy improvements. Theoretically, evaluation is a crucial stage in the ongoing and adaptive policy cycle. Evaluation encompasses the assessment of the policy context, implementation process, resulting outputs, and emerging outcomes. International studies also indicate that evaluation in the bureaucratic sector needs to consider the capacity of implementing institutions, policy legitimacy, and the level of acceptance by stakeholders. In Indonesia, the practice of policy evaluation in local governments is growing as part of the bureaucratic reform agenda, particularly in assessing the effectiveness of regional regulations, including policies related to the management of civil servants (ASN).

Public policy evaluation is a structured process for assessing the relevance, effectiveness, efficiency, impact, and sustainability of a policy using specific indicators and scientific methods. In addition to measuring program achievements, evaluation also assesses implementation gaps, the quality of policy governance, and its impact on target groups. Studies show that policy evaluation in the public sector faces significant obstacles, such as incomplete performance data, bureaucratic resistance, and weak monitoring and follow-up mechanisms for evaluation results. At the local government level, evaluation is crucial to ensure that local policies not only meet regulatory requirements but also provide genuine benefits and improve the quality of public services. Therefore, when conducting an evaluation ASN policies, particularly talent management policies, must measure the suitability of implementation with regulations, the effectiveness of the competency development process, and the potential for long-term sustainability of the policy.

The policy evaluation approach used in this study serves to assess how the policy process is implemented, examine the results achieved, and assess the degree to which its implementation aligns with the objectives set out in the regulation. Relevant evaluation models include Policy Evaluation in the Public Policy Cycle (Dunn), Process Outcome Evaluation, and the CIPP (Context, Input, Process, Product) model, as all three provide a comprehensive overview of the policy context, resource readiness, implementation process, and impact. These models are highly suitable for evaluating Surabaya Mayoral Regulation No. 30 of 2021, as this policy encompasses systematic stages such as talent identification, competency development, succession mapping, and ASN retention. Given these characteristics, process- and outcome- based evaluations are more appropriate than assessments that focus solely on administrative aspects. Several studies have also shown that process- and outcome- oriented evaluations are more effective in identifying implementation gaps, measuring the effectiveness of talent development, and assessing the extent to which policies work within a bureaucratic context. Therefore, this evaluation approach is considered most appropriate for assessing the extent to which talent management policies at the Surabaya City Education Office are implemented in accordance with normative and operational objectives and their expected impacts.

2. METHODS

This study employed a qualitative approach with a case study strategy, as proposed by Creswell (2018), which emphasizes an in-depth exploration of a phenomenon within its real-life

context. This approach was selected because the research focuses on evaluating the implementation of a public policy, namely Surabaya Mayor Regulation Number 30 of 2021 concerning Civil Servant Talent Management, particularly its implementation within the Surabaya City Education Office. A case study strategy was considered appropriate because it enables the researcher to gain a comprehensive understanding of policy implementation by examining organizational dynamics, the perspectives of policy actors, and the contextual factors that influence the effectiveness of the policy. The research focused on evaluating the implementation of ASN talent management policies in the Surabaya City Education Office. Specifically, the study examined three main aspects: the implementation of talent management policies, the mechanisms for competency and performance development of civil servants, and the supporting as well as inhibiting factors encountered during the implementation process. The Surabaya City Education Office was selected as the research locus because it is directly involved in implementing human resource management policies for civil servants under the coordination of the Surabaya City Government.

The study utilized both primary and secondary data sources. Primary data were obtained through in-depth interviews with personnel officials, structural officials, and civil servants who were directly involved in or affected by the implementation of the talent management policy. Secondary data were collected from regulatory documents, work plans, performance reports, official guidelines, and relevant academic literature related to personnel management and ASN competency development. These multiple sources of evidence were used to provide a comprehensive understanding of the policy implementation process. Data collection was conducted through in-depth interviews using a semi-structured interview guide, allowing the researcher to explore informants' experiences, perceptions, and views while maintaining alignment with the research objectives. In addition, documentation studies were carried out to examine regulations, policy guidelines, and organizational reports relevant to the implementation of the policy. The interviews were conducted face-to-face, with each session lasting approximately 30-60 minutes depending on the depth of information provided by the informants. With the participants' consent, all interviews were audio-recorded and subsequently transcribed verbatim to ensure data accuracy and facilitate the analysis process.

The study involved six informants selected through purposive sampling based on their roles, responsibilities, knowledge, and involvement in the implementation of the talent management policy. The informants consisted of personnel management officials, structural officials, and civil servants participating in the talent pool program who were directly involved in the implementation of the policy. Data analysis followed Creswell's (2018) qualitative analysis procedures, which include organizing and preparing the data, reading and reviewing the entire dataset, coding relevant information, developing themes and categories, interpreting the meaning of the findings, and presenting the results in a descriptive narrative. The interpretation process was guided by public policy evaluation theories and the context of implementing Surabaya Mayor Regulation Number 30 of 2021. To ensure the trustworthiness of the findings, several validation techniques were employed. These included source triangulation by comparing information from different informants and documents, member checking to verify the accuracy of interpretations with participants, peer debriefing through discussions with academic supervisors or colleagues, and maintaining an audit trail to document the research process systematically. Ethical considerations were also observed throughout the study. Prior to data collection, participants were informed about the purpose and procedures of the research and were asked to provide voluntary informed consent. Participants' identities were anonymized to protect confidentiality and privacy throughout the research process. Their participation was entirely voluntary, and the information provided was used solely for academic purposes.

3. RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

This study uses the CIPP (Context, Input, Process, Product) evaluation model developed by Daniel L. Stufflebeam to assess the implementation of the ASN Talent Management policy based on Surabaya Mayor Regulation Number 30 of 2021. This model was chosen because it is able to provide a comprehensive picture starting from the background and policy needs (context), resource readiness (input), implementation process (process), to the results and impact of the policy (product).

A. Context

In the CIPP evaluation model developed by Daniel L. Stufflebeam, context is an evaluation component that focuses on analyzing the background, needs, problems, and environment in which a program is implemented. Context evaluation aims to identify real needs, problems to be addressed, and opportunities to be developed so that the program has a clear foundation and direction. In addition, context evaluation helps determine objectives, program priorities and strategies to align with organizational conditions, policies, and internal and external factors that influence program implementation. Thus, context serves as a foundation for formulating targets and ensuring that programs are truly relevant and meet needs.

Based on interviews with personnel leaders/managers and civil servants participating in the talent pool, it can be concluded that the implementation of talent management at the Surabaya City Education Office is driven by the organization's strategic need to improve the quality of civil servant human resources. Leaders explained that before talent management, there was still a mismatch between job requirements and employee competencies. Several key positions were difficult to fill due to the limited number of employees with adequate capacity and potential. Furthermore, the employee placement process was not entirely merit-based. These conditions became the main background for the implementation of talent management as a mechanism to ensure that employees were placed according to their competencies and to strengthen career planning in a more systematic and objective manner.

The urgency of this policy becomes clearer when leaders identify competency gaps, the need for more structured employee potential mapping, and the organization's demand to prepare future leaders capable of occupying strategic positions. The implementation of talent management is considered crucial for enhancing civil servant professionalism, maintaining organizational continuity, and ensuring the availability of high-performing talent. From the perspective of civil servants participating in the program, this policy is considered relevant because it provides opportunities to improve competency, gain experience, and expand networks between regional government agencies (OPDs). Informants reported that the training they participated in helped them better understand administrative tasks and provided practical benefits, although some training sometimes did not align with their field of work. This indicates that the policy is effective, but the alignment of development materials with job requirements still needs improvement. Interviews also showed that this policy aligns with organizational needs, helping map employee potential, support competency development, and prepare for job succession. Policy planning involved various parties, including the Ministry of Administrative and Bureaucratic Reform (KemenPAN-RB), the National Civil Service Agency (BKN), the mayor's PPK (Regional Personnel Agency), the Regional Personnel Agency (BKPSDM), and unit leaders who proposed potential employees.

The goal setting mechanism is carried out through a talent management cycle that includes identification, assessment, development, placement, and evaluation. Overall, the context component of the CIPP model demonstrates that talent management policies have a strong contextual basis. There is a clear organizational need to address competency gaps, strengthen merit systems, and improve the quality of human resources. However, several gaps remain. Notes such as: (1) employee competency gaps in certain positions; (2) competency data mapping that

has not yet been fully integrated; (3) the mechanism for appointing talent pool participants that is still top-down; and (4) an understanding of the concept of talent management that is not yet evenly distributed across all work units. These findings provide important insights for further analysis at the input, process, and product stages.

The findings indicate that talent management at the Surabaya City Education Office emerged from a strategic need to strengthen competency-based human resource management and ensure leadership succession. Similar conditions have been reported in various public-sector organizations, where talent management is introduced to address competency gaps, improve succession readiness, and strengthen merit-based personnel systems (Arlina, 2025). Therefore, the context identified in this study reflects broader challenges faced by local governments in implementing talent management.

In terms of competency data mapping and integration, SIMPEG and employee assessments have been utilized, but their accuracy and interconnectedness remain limited. This situation aligns with the findings of Syah & Rachman (2020), who emphasized that one of the main obstacles to talent management implementation in the regions is data misalignment between personnel systems, assessments, and competency databases. A recent study by Yuliani & Baskoro (2022) also underscored the need for real-time integration to make talent mapping more objective and directly applicable to decision-making. This finding suggests that policymakers should prioritize the integration of competency assessment results, personnel databases, and development records into a unified digital platform. Such integration would enable more accurate talent mapping and support evidence-based decisions regarding promotion, rotation, and succession planning.

The talent pool selection mechanism is still top-down, indicating that the policy does not fully reflect the principle of openness of the merit system. This situation is reinforced by research by Masrully & Saputro (2024), who found that direct appointment practices often create perceptions of unfairness and can reduce policy legitimacy. They emphasized that an open registration system and the publication of selection criteria are crucial components in ensuring policy acceptance by employees, an aspect also seen as a weakness in the case of the Surabaya Education Office. To address this issue, policymakers should establish a more transparent talent identification mechanism by publishing selection criteria, providing opportunities for employee self-nomination, and communicating assessment results more openly. These measures could strengthen employee trust and reinforce the principles of the merit system.

The unequal understanding of talent management concepts across work units indicates a lack of policy internalization. This finding is consistent with research by Nursalim & Hidayat (2023), which emphasized that technical understanding and implementer capacity are key factors in success during the initial implementation phase. Without adequate socialization, technical SOPs, and manager training, policies often become mere formalities without consistent implementation. This situation was reflected in interviews with implementers at the field and sub-section levels. Therefore, regular socialization programs, technical guidelines, and competency-building initiatives for managers and talent management administrators are needed to ensure consistent understanding and implementation across organizational units.

Regarding the relevance of talent development materials, some informants found the training useful, but others considered the materials inadequate for their job requirements. This finding aligns with the study by Muna & Suratman (2024), which showed that the effectiveness of talent development is largely determined by the accuracy of the training needs analysis and the alignment of the training curriculum with functional tasks. Mismatching the materials with the realities of daily work has been shown to reduce the program's impact on performance improvement and succession readiness. Consequently, future development programs should be

based on systematic training needs assessments to ensure that learning activities correspond to employees' functional responsibilities and career development requirements.

Overall, the context evaluation demonstrates that the implementation of talent management at the Surabaya City Education Office is supported by a clear organizational need to improve competency alignment, strengthen merit-based human resource management, and prepare future leaders. However, the findings also reveal several gaps related to data integration, participant selection mechanisms, policy internalization, and the alignment of development programs with employee needs. Addressing these gaps requires concrete policy actions, including the development of integrated talent management information systems, greater transparency in talent identification processes, continuous capacity-building programs, and competency-based training planning. Strengthening these aspects is essential to ensure that talent management contributes effectively to organizational performance and long-term succession sustainability.

B. Input

The Input component of the CIPP (Context, Input, Process, Product) evaluation model developed by Daniel L. Stufflebeam emphasizes the extent to which a program possesses the requisite resources, implementation strategies, and supporting instruments to attain policy objectives. Evaluation at this stage serves to assess whether planning, procedures, and implementation mechanisms have been adequately designed to ensure effective policy implementation. In the context of this research, input indicators are employed to evaluate the readiness of the implementation of Surabaya Mayor Regulation Number 30 of 2021 concerning Civil Servant Talent Management, particularly within the Surabaya City Education Office. This assessment considers aspects of institutional readiness, ASN selection criteria, and the clarity of implementation mechanisms. Interviews with two informants revealed contrasting yet complementary perspectives on the implementation of this policy. The first informant, a personnel officer at the Surabaya City Education Office, elucidated:

"The main indicators are based on performance, potential, motivation, experience, readiness to change, superior input, and relevance of career path."

Meanwhile, the second informant is a civil servant participating in the talent pool convey that:

"Information is usually received via email or direct appointment from the leadership, who usually coordinates with the Regional Personnel Agency (BKD). He said it's quite clear because participants are officially appointed and confirmed through the administrative system (e-mail)."

From these two statements, it can be concluded that personnel officials highlight the technical and substantive aspects of selection indicators, which include dimensions of performance, potential, motivation, and experience, as well as input from direct superiors and relevance to career paths. This indicates that the process of selecting ASN into the talent pool is based on an objective and merit-based approach, where potential mapping is carried out by considering the individual's actual abilities and readiness for development. Meanwhile, the second informant provided a perspective from the perspective of the policy implementers or participants. He assessed that the program's implementation mechanism was quite clear and transparent because it was carried out officially through an e-mail-based administration system and appointments by leaders in coordination with the Regional Personnel Agency (BKD). However, the process of selecting participants was still top-down, where ASN did not have ample opportunity to register independently according to their potential and interests.

A comparative analysis of the perspectives of the organizers and policy implementers reveals notable disparities in their viewpoints. Personnel officers evaluate policies from a regulatory and indicator-based standpoint, while participants assess the systematic selection process and the transparency of the appointment procedure. Both parties acknowledge the Education Office's well-functioning mechanism from an administrative and institutional perspective. However, in terms of civil servant participation, the policy requires further development to enhance openness and inclusivity. In essence, while the policy's input is strong in terms of systems and procedures, there is a need for improvement in participation and active employee involvement in the selection process. When aligned with Stufflebeam's CIPP theory, the findings indicate that the Surabaya City Education Office possesses good institutional readiness at the Input stage. This includes clear selection criteria, a digital-based administration system, and coordination between implementing agencies such as the Regional Personnel Agency (BKD). This suggests that the talent management policy has met the preparedness and resource adequacy aspects, which are crucial elements in the Input stage of the CIPP model. However, as Stufflebeam elucidates, the effectiveness of input is not solely determined by the completeness of the system but also by participation and the relevance of implementation to the program's objectives. In this context, the implementation of the ASN talent management policy at the Education Office necessitates expanding opportunities for employees to actively participate in the selection process. This would transform the mechanism from a solely appointment-based system to one that also facilitates applications based on competency and career aspirations. Although the administrative mechanism is deemed clear, the continued reliance on leader nomination implies a need to establish more participatory talent identification mechanisms. Providing avenues for self-nomination or open applications could aid in identifying hidden talent, enhance employee engagement, and foster perceptions of fairness within the talent management system.

These findings align with previous studies indicating that successful talent management implementation hinges on the availability of explicit selection criteria, sufficient institutional support, transparent administrative systems, and active employee participation (Mayasari & Febriantoko, 2018; Wei & Dai, 2021; Subhaktiyasa et al., 2022; Hidayat et al., 2023; Wahidah et al., 2023). Collectively, these studies suggest that organizational readiness alone is insufficient if employees have limited opportunities to participate in talent identification and development processes.

In contrast to previous studies, the Surabaya City Education Office demonstrates adequate readiness in terms of regulations, institutional support, and talent identification procedures. However, several areas require improvement, particularly employee participation, competency-based development planning, and implementation flexibility. Therefore, policymakers should consider introducing open talent registration mechanisms, developing more comprehensive technical SOPs, and strengthening competency development systems that are directly linked to assessment results and career pathways. These actions would enhance both transparency and effectiveness, ensuring that talent management contributes more directly to organizational performance and long-term succession planning.

C. Process

In the CIPP evaluation model, process is the evaluation component that assesses how a policy is implemented, including implementation stages, operational mechanisms, inter-unit coordination, obstacles encountered, and the quality of program execution. Process evaluation helps determine whether a program is implemented effectively and in accordance with its intended objectives. Based on interviews with Informant 1, talent management at the Surabaya City Education Office has been implemented through employee nomination and participation in training programs coordinated by BKPSDM. Although the process has been carried out according to administrative procedures, its implementation has not been fully consistent due to limited human resources, heavy workloads, and budget constraints. In addition, understanding of talent

management remains uneven across work units, causing implementation to focus primarily on training participation rather than structured competency and career development. Monitoring and evaluation are also still centered on administrative compliance rather than measuring the quality and impact of development activities.

According to Informant 2, talent management is mainly experienced through participation in various training programs assigned by supervisors. However, some training activities are not always aligned with employees' job competencies, indicating that competency development has not been fully based on talent mapping or organizational needs. Participants are generally encouraged to share knowledge gained from training with colleagues, but post-training follow-up remains informal and lacks standardized procedures. Informant 2 also reported challenges with the web-based learning system, including confusing navigation, limited user guidance, and the absence of features that allow participants to review learning materials. These limitations reduce learning effectiveness and make participants more dependent on assistance from colleagues. More specifically, participants reported that the platform lacked several features commonly found in modern learning management systems, including a personalized learning dashboard, progress tracking tools, automated training recommendations based on competency assessment results, and access to recorded learning materials for later review. In addition, the system was not integrated with talent management databases, making it difficult to connect training participation with competency gaps, career development plans, or talent pool status. As a result, learning activities were often treated as standalone training events rather than as part of a structured talent development pathway.

From the perspective of the CIPP model, these findings indicate that talent management implementation has established clear administrative mechanisms but has not yet achieved optimal implementation quality. The mismatch between training programs and job competency needs is particularly significant because it may limit the impact of competency development on organizational performance. This finding is consistent with Putri and Ardiansyah (2023) and Hidayat and Mulyani (2021), who found that competency development in public organizations is often influenced more by training availability than by actual competency requirements. Therefore, the Surabaya City Education Office should strengthen competency mapping and training needs analysis to ensure that development programs are aligned with organizational priorities. Policymakers should therefore establish a competency-based training allocation mechanism that links assessment results, organizational competency requirements, and individual development plans. Such an approach would improve the relevance of training investments and ensure that development programs directly support succession planning objectives.

The study also highlights weaknesses in post-training follow-up and the digital learning system. Without structured coaching, mentoring, and evaluation after training, the benefits of learning may not be fully translated into improved workplace performance. Similarly, technical barriers within the learning platform can reduce participant engagement and learning outcomes. Improvements such as action plans, mentoring programs, recorded learning materials, and technical support services are therefore necessary. In practical terms, this requires the development of formal post-training action plans, mentoring assignments, and performance follow-up mechanisms that allow supervisors to monitor how newly acquired competencies are applied in the workplace. Furthermore, monitoring and evaluation activities remain largely administrative and do not adequately assess training relevance, competency improvement, or organizational impact. This finding aligns with Sari and Wibowo (2024), who argue that implementation quality cannot be ensured through procedures alone without comprehensive evaluation mechanisms. Consequently, the Surabaya City Education Office should develop a more comprehensive monitoring and evaluation framework that measures both implementation quality and development outcomes.

Overall, the findings suggest that the process aspect of talent management at the Surabaya City Education Office has functioned procedurally but remains suboptimal in terms of implementation quality. The main challenges relate to competency alignment, post-training follow-up, learning system effectiveness, and evaluation quality. Addressing these issues requires more than regulatory compliance; it demands stronger integration between competency assessment, training programs, digital learning systems, and performance management processes. By strengthening these areas, policymakers can ensure that talent management becomes a strategic instrument for developing competent civil servants and supporting long-term organizational performance and leadership succession.

D. Product

In the CIPP evaluation model, Product refers to the results, outputs, changes, and impacts achieved from the implementation of a program or policy. Product evaluation not only assesses the immediate outputs produced but also measures outcomes and the benefits experienced by both individuals and organizations. Therefore, the product component is used to determine the extent to which program objectives have been achieved and whether the results provide sustainable value to the organization. Based on interviews with management and civil servants participating in the talent pool program, the implementation of talent management within the Surabaya City Education Office has produced several outputs that indicate progress in human resource management. From the management perspective, the most significant outcomes include the establishment of a talent pool, employee potential mapping, and more structured competency documentation. The availability of this data is important because it provides a more objective basis for decision-making regarding promotions, transfers, and career development. Prior to the implementation of systematic competency mapping, employee placement decisions were more likely to rely on less measurable considerations. Through the talent pool system, the organization now has more accurate information regarding employee potential and competencies, reducing the risk of job mismatches. This finding is consistent with Lestari (2023), who argued that talent pools and competency mapping serve as fundamental pillars of talent management in the public sector by supporting career planning and merit-based staffing decisions.

From the employees' perspective, the primary benefits include improved competencies, broader work experience, and opportunities to build professional networks with participants from other government agencies. In addition, training certificates contribute positively to performance evaluations and career advancement opportunities. These benefits are significant because they demonstrate that talent management generates not only administrative outputs but also direct impacts on individual capacity development. Improved competencies can enhance job performance, increase administrative efficiency, and expand employees' perspectives in adapting to changing workplace demands. This finding supports Saragih (2024), who found that structured competency development programs for civil servants contribute to greater work effectiveness and improved public service quality.

The findings also indicate that participants contribute to organizational learning through knowledge-sharing activities after completing training programs. Sharing training materials, presentations, and information with colleagues serves as a mechanism for disseminating knowledge throughout the organization. This is important because the benefits of training extend beyond individual participants and can create broader organizational impacts. When knowledge transfer is carried out consistently, organizations can maximize the return on investment in employee development programs. However, the current knowledge-sharing process largely depends on the initiative of supervisors and lacks standardized procedures. As a result, learning outcomes may not be distributed evenly across the organization. Therefore, the Surabaya City Education Office should establish policies requiring participants to prepare learning reports or conduct structured knowledge-sharing sessions to ensure that training benefits reach a wider

range of employees. Such a mechanism would also allow organizational leaders to monitor the diffusion of knowledge and evaluate whether training investments generate broader organizational benefits beyond individual participants.

Despite these positive outputs, the findings suggest that they have not yet fully translated into optimal outcomes. One major issue identified is that not all training programs attended by employees align with the competency requirements of their positions. This finding is important because the success of talent management should not be measured solely by the number of employees participating in training but also by the relevance of development programs to organizational needs. When training content is not aligned with job requirements, the competencies acquired may not be effectively applied in daily work activities. Consequently, investments in employee development may fail to produce significant improvements in organizational performance. This finding is consistent with Kravariti et al. (2022), who identified the lack of alignment between organizational competency needs and development programs as a major challenge in public-sector talent management. Therefore, policymakers should strengthen the integration between competency mapping results, job requirements, and training planning to ensure that development programs effectively support organizational goals.

Another important issue concerns the digital learning system used during training programs. Participants reported difficulties related to navigation, limited user guidance, the absence of replay features, and restricted access to learning materials after training completion. These limitations reduced learning effectiveness and created unequal learning experiences among participants with different levels of digital literacy. As a result, some employees were unable to fully benefit from competency development activities despite participating in the same programs.

In addition to technical challenges, the study found that competency data generated through the talent pool system has not yet been utilized consistently in all human resource management processes. In fact, competency data represents one of the most valuable outputs of talent management because it can support more accurate employee placement, structured career development, and sustainable succession planning. If competency data is not used effectively in decision-making processes, the strategic value of talent management is significantly reduced. Consequently, organizations may revert to conventional human resource management practices that are less focused on employee potential and competencies. Therefore, stronger commitment from organizational leaders is needed to ensure that talent pool data is consistently used as the basis for promotions, transfers, and career development decisions.

Overall, the product evaluation demonstrates that talent management implementation at the Surabaya City Education Office has generated meaningful outputs, particularly in the areas of competency mapping, talent pool development, employee capacity building, and organizational knowledge sharing. However, the findings also indicate that these outputs have not yet been fully translated into sustainable organizational outcomes. To maximize the long-term value of talent management, policymakers should ensure stronger alignment between competency mapping and training programs, improve the effectiveness of digital learning systems, institutionalize knowledge-sharing practices, and consistently utilize talent pool data in promotion, rotation, and succession decisions. These actions are essential to transform talent management from an administrative initiative into a strategic instrument for organizational performance improvement and leadership sustainability.

4. CONCLUSION

The research findings reveal that the Civil Servant Talent Management policy, grounded in Surabaya Mayoral Regulation Number 30 of 2021, holds significant relevance to the organizational requirements of the Surabaya City Education Office. From a contextual and input standpoint, this policy is driven by competency gaps, job succession needs, and the imperative to fortify a merit-based career system. The implementation of this policy is supported by adequate

institutional preparedness, evidenced by relatively clear selection indicators, budgetary support, and the utilization of digital systems for personnel data management. Nevertheless, the talent pool selection mechanism still exhibits a top-down tendency, resulting in suboptimal participation of civil servants in the selection process and applications based on potential and interests.

In terms of process and product, the implementation of talent management policies has been conducted in accordance with established administrative procedures and has yielded several positive outcomes, including the establishment of a talent pool, ASN competency mapping, and the enhancement of employee knowledge and skills through development programs. However, the quality of policy implementation is not yet fully optimal. This is reflected in competency development that is not yet fully aligned with job requirements, monitoring and evaluation mechanisms that remain administratively oriented, and the suboptimal utilization of competency data in career planning and job succession. The theoretical implications of these findings suggest that the effectiveness of ASN talent management policies is not solely determined by the completeness of regulations and the readiness of inputs, but also heavily contingent upon the quality of the implementation process and the integration of talent development outcomes into personnel decision-making.

These findings reinforce the relevance of the CIPP evaluation model in analyzing public policy in the personnel sector, while also emphasizing that the gap between policy design and implementation practices remains a major challenge in the application of talent management in local governments. The novelty of this research lies in the comprehensive application of the CIPP evaluation model in evaluating ASN talent management policies in the regional education sector, which is still relatively limited in public policy studies in Indonesia. This research has limitations, including the research locus that only focuses on one regional apparatus, so the findings cannot be generalized widely, and the limited number of informants that affects the depth of perspective variation. Furthermore, this study does not quantitatively measure the policy's impact on organizational performance and the quality of public services.

Based on the findings, several practical recommendations can be proposed for stakeholders. The Surabaya City Government and BKPSDM should develop a Standard Operating Procedure (SOP) for open talent pool registration within the next six months to enhance transparency and employee participation in the talent identification process. Additionally, competency assessment results, employee performance records, and talent development data should be integrated into a unified digital talent management system to support evidence-based promotion, rotation, and succession decisions. Competency development programs should also be designed based on training needs analysis and evaluated using outcome-oriented indicators rather than solely administrative participation records. Furthermore, these findings may serve as a reference for other regional governments in Indonesia that are implementing ASN talent management policies, particularly in improving transparency, competency-based development, data integration, and merit-based succession planning.

Considering the limitations of this study, future research is recommended to expand the scope of analysis to several regional apparatus organizations or other local governments in order to compare policy implementation practices. Future studies are also encouraged to employ a mixed methods approach to more objectively measure the impact of ASN talent management policies on individual and organizational performance, as well as to further examine the integration of competency data systems and merit-based succession mechanisms as key factors supporting policy sustainability.

REFERENCES

Akib, H., & Tarigan, A. (2022). Evaluation of regional public policy implementation in Indonesia. *Journal of Public Policy and Administration*, 6(2).

- Amalia, N., & Zalukhu, R. (2025). Analisis penerapan manajemen talenta ASN: Studi pada instansi pemerintah daerah. *Indonesian Public Sector Studies Journal*, 3(1), 45–58.
- Arlina, D. (2025). Implementation of ASN Talent Management in the Midst of Budget Efficiency. *Journal of ASN Policy and Management*, 19(1), 1–113.
- Azzizah, U. (2024). Implementing the merit system through. *Journal of Public Administration*.
- Barkhuizen, N. E., & Gumede, B. (2021). The relationship between talent management, job satisfaction and voluntary turnover intentions of employees in a selected government institution. *SA Journal of Human Resource Management/ SA Tydskrif Hulpbronbestuur*
- Basuki, AD (2024). Analysis of the effectiveness of talent management implementation. *Journal of Planning & Administration (JPlan)*.
- Dunn, W. N. (2018). *Public Policy Analysis: An Integrated Approach* (6th ed.). Routledge.
- Fauzian, NR (2024). Digitalised talent management in the public sector. *Journal of Local Service Studies*.
- Handayani, D. (2023). Implementasi manajemen talenta sebagai upaya membangun Aparatur Sipil Negara profesional di Pemerintah Kota Pontianak. *Jurnal Administrasi Publik dan Pemerintahan*, 8(2), 112–124.
- Hartini, Rugaiyah, Kahar, A. (2020). Evaluation of the 2018 POLRI Specialization Development Education Program at the POLRI First Level Leadership School. *VisiPena Journal*, 11(2), 416–426.
- Hasibuan, M. (2022). Human resource management and merit-based talent development in local government. *Journal of Public Administration*, 14(2), 112– 124.
- Kozjek, T. (2020). Talent Management in the Public Sector: A literature review. *CEPAR / Regional Public Administration Review*.
- Kravariti, F., Tasoulis, K., Scullion, H., Alali, M.K., (2022). Talent management and performance in the public sector: The role of organizational and line managerial support for development. *The International Journal of Human Resource Management*, 42(2), 139–148.
- Lestari, R. (2023). Evaluation of the implementation of ASN talent management in local government: Challenges of competency assessment and job succession. *Journal of Public Sector Human Resource Management*, 8(1), 45–60.
- Masrully & Saputro, HN (2024). Challenges in Implementing Civil Service Talent Management in Supporting the Bureaucratic Reform Agenda in Regional Governments. *Journal of Civil Service Policy and Management*, 12(2), 145–160.
- Maulana, F., & Fitriani, L. (2025). The quality of the training implementation process as a determinant of the success of ASN competency development. *Journal of Management and Public Policy*, 9(1), 23–38.
- Mayasari, R., & Febriantoko, J. (2018). Evaluation of work programs and financial performance of local government in Indonesia through the CIPP model. *International Journal of Contemporary Research and Reviews*, 9(12).
- Muna, RS, & Suratman, A. (2024). Implementation of Talent Management Through Competency Assessment of ASN in Supervisory Positions in Pekalongan Regency Government. *Journal of Management and Business Administration*, 2(1), 120–131.
- Nawawi, I. (2022). Evaluation of public policy in the regional government sector. *Journal Science of Public Administration*, 19(3).
- Noors, AIA (2019). Mainstreaming Talent Management in the Human Resources Governance of the Indonesian Bureaucracy. *Journal of Government Science Suara Khatulistiwa (JIPSK)*, 4(2), 38–49.

- Nguyen, H., et al. (2020). Public policy evaluation in governance reform: Challenges and prospects. *Public Administration Review*, 80(5).
- Nugroho, R. (2021). *Public Policy: Theory, Management, Dynamics, Analysis, Convergence, and Policy Chemistry* (6th ed.). Elex Media Komputindo.
- Pedhu, Y. (2022). Context, Input, Process, and Product Evaluation Model: Its Nature and Application in Guidance and Counseling. *Journal of Psychoeducation*, 20(1), 53–64.
- Surabaya City Government. (2021). Surabaya Mayor Regulation Number 30 of 2021 concerning Civil Servant Talent Management within the Surabaya City Government. <https://pemerintahan.surabaya.go.id/basis-data/storage/regulations/1657777681.pdf>
- Putri, AR, & Ardiansyah, M. (2023). Development of civil servant competencies based on job needs in local government. *Journal of Public Policy and Management*, 8(2), 101–114.
- Pramesti, EN (2023). Analysis of the implementation of civil servant talent management. *Discourse Public*, 3(2), 343–356.
- Pramusinto, A., & Kumorotomo, W. (2020). Governance reform and policy evaluation in Indonesian bureaucracy. *Indonesian Policy Journal*, 5(2).
- Rahmawati, D., & Nugroho, A. (2022). Evaluation of the implementation of state civil servant training based on a digital learning system. *Journal of Public Human Resource Management*, 6(1), 67–79.
- Saragih, JMK (2024). Analysis of government employee placement mechanisms: a study of civil servant teachers. *Academic Media Journal*.
- Sari, NP, & Wibowo, TA (2024). Evaluation of the implementation of human resource development policies for civil servants using the CIPP model. *Journal of Public Administration*, 12(1), 55–69.
- Hidayat, AZ, Zulaikha, S., & Rochanah, S. (2023). Evaluation of student interest and talent development program at Yasporbi 1 Elementary School. *International Education Trend Issues*, 1(3).
- Hidayat, R., & Mulyani, S. (2021). Implementation of civil servant talent management in local government agencies. *Journal of Public Administration*, 11(2), 145–158.
- Subhaktiyasa, PG, Ratnaya, IG, Nazim, M., Bayangkari, B., & Suprpta, MA(2022). The evaluation of career center management at health colleges: A CIPP model approach. *Basicedu Journal*, 6(5).
- Syah, RF, & Rachman, NA (2020). ASN Database Agency: A Portrait of the Governance of the Yogyakarta and Banjarbaru City Government Personnel Database. *JSPG: Journal of Social Politics and Governance*, 2(2), 121–134.
- Wahidah, I., Listyasari, E., Rahmat, AA, & Rohyana, A. (2023). Evaluation of physical education independent curriculum through CIPP: Managerial implementation in learning activities. *Indonesian Journal of Sport Management*, 3(2).
- Wahyuni, LR, & Suwena, KR (2025). The role of talent management in public organizations.
- Wei, C., & Dai, F. (2021). Evaluation of talent cultivation quality of modern apprenticeship based on context-input-process-product model. *International Journal of Emerging Technologies in Learning*, 16(14).